

**City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting**  
**Agenda Item J-5**  
**December 11, 2018**  
**City Commission Chambers**  
**405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL**

**City Commission**

**Mayor Raul Valdes-Fauli**  
**Vice Mayor Vince Lago**  
**Commissioner Pat Keon**  
**Commissioner Michael Mena**  
**Commissioner Frank Quesada**

**City Staff**

**City Manager, Peter Iglesias**  
**Assistant City Manager, Ed Santamaria**  
**City Attorney, Miriam Ramos**  
**Assistant City Attorney, Gus Ceballos**  
**City Clerk, Walter J. Foeman**  
**Deputy City Clerk, Billy Urquia**

**Public Speaker(s)**

---

Agenda Item J-5 [0:00:00 p.m.]

Update on staff analysis of EV parking requirements for development projects.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Good morning, Mr. Mayor, members of the Commission. For the record, Ed Santamaria, Assistant City Manager, Operations and Infrastructure. Before you is J-5, to discuss electric vehicle charging requirements in the Zoning Code. On October 23, there was a meeting where this item came up and it was decided that the Commission required further information to be able to make a more educated decision on it. So, I believe there was a

---

City Commission Meeting  
December 11, 2018

Agenda Item J-5 - Update on staff analysis of EV parking requirements for development projects.

presentation by Tesla and there was some discussion that was spurred by that presentation. So, right now, the Coral Gables current Zoning Code stipulates that there would be 20 percent -- I'm sorry, 2 percent of electric vehicle charging stations for every case where you have 20 or more off-street parking spaces. And so, these -- in this particular code, these spaces would be charging spaces. So, we also have some definitions that we need to understand in this process. First and foremost, we have electric vehicle capable, which means that there's infrastructure in place, including raceways, conduits to the electric vehicle space, but not necessarily the contactors or necessary the switch gear, but there will be space for a switch gear in any space that is necessary for future switch gear and implementation of electric vehicle charging spaces. We also have EV ready, which means that everything is in place. All that has to happen is for someone to come in with an EV charger, set it in place, connect it and you are able to charge vehicles at that point. There's no further work that's required. And we also have...

Vice Mayor Lago: Which that is more costly.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Right.

Commissioner Mena: Just to be clear. Last time, when we discussed this, I think we were using the phrase EV ready a lot. Are you saying that what we were actually discussing was EV capable at that meeting?

Vice Mayor Lago: Oh, yes, EV capable, yes, correct. We're discussing about a...

Assistant City Attorney Ceballos: Pardon my interruption. Assistant City Attorney Gus Ceballos. Last meeting, the only discussion we were having was EV ready. EV ready means that the conduits are run, the cable is there. The only thing that needs to be brought -- as the Assistant City Manager stated -- was you bring your charger and you install it.

Commissioner Mena: Is that what we discussed at that -- when we...

Assistant City Attorney Ceballos: That is what we discussed.

Vice Mayor Lago: That's what we discussed when we -- 20 percent -- we were considering a 20 percent...

Unidentified Speaker: Right.

Vice Mayor Lago: Number.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Commissioner Mena: Right, right.

Vice Mayor Lago: And we were going to -- we were asking staff to look at the cost.

Commissioner Mena: It was for 20 percent to be EV ready.

Assistant City Attorney Ceballos: EV ready, correct.

Vice Mayor Lago: All you do is just basically bring the car charger connection.

City Manager Iglesias: All the infrastructure would be in.

Commissioner Mena: Okay.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: There is...

Vice Mayor Lago: The conduits would have been run and the whole thing.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: There's also some discrepancy in the way that Tesla phrased it and I think the Tesla report said that EV ready would be -- was EV capable. So, there was some disconnect there. So, I just wanted to clarify the definitions. EV capable, meaning that it would require further work, putting in contactors, establishing of electric service, et cetera, et cetera to make that station EV ready.

Vice Mayor Lago: But right now, as a City, we're requiring new buildings to have 2 percent...

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Two percent to be EV -- actually electrical -- electric vehicles charging stations, right now.

Commissioner Mena: Is...

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Fully...

Commissioner Mena: Yeah, no. I -- is the work required to go from EV capable to EV ready -- is that work that's easily done after a building is built or is that -- because I thought the goal was, okay, as you're building a new building, let's do what -- let's already go ahead and put in the infrastructure necessary to be capable in the future as we go more in that direction. So, I guess my question is, are we focused on doing something where it's a higher requirement for EV capable or for EV fully ready?

City Manager Iglesias: Commissioner, if I...

Commissioner Mena: You understand my question?

Vice Mayor Lago: I know exactly what you're saying. We had this discussion for about 30 minutes.

City Manager Iglesias: I can answer that. If you have the infrastructure in during construction, it's much easier to get it in and much cheaper than coming back and retrofitting.

Commissioner Mena: Right, right.

City Manager Iglesias: So, you have the infrastructure, it means you have the areas for the equipment. You have the conduit in place.

Vice Mayor Lago: The panel.

Commissioner Mena: That's EV capable.

City Manager Iglesias: But you don't have the actual wire, service and all the other issues.

Commissioner Mena: EV capable...

Vice Mayor Lago: Yes.

Commissioner Mena: Is my point.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: It's EV capable.

City Manager Iglesias: EV capable.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Correct.

City Manager Iglesias: EV ready means all the infrastructure is in.

Commissioner Mena: Okay.

City Manager Iglesias: It's ready to receive the charging unit. The charging unit's installed and can be used.

Vice Mayor Lago: What -- and correct me, if I'm wrong -- what Tesla wanted was 20 percent EV ready.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: That's correct.

Vice Mayor Lago: Which we had that long back-and-forth discussion about the cost implications...

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Vice Mayor Lago: From the developer.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Which were...

Vice Mayor Lago: Which were substantial.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Right.

Commissioner Keon: Were substantial.

City Manager Iglesias: Which is...

Vice Mayor Lago: So, you have California and other states that are already looking at EV -- 20 percent being the norm, EV ready. Now, the question is, do we want -- I'll let him -- let...

Commissioner Mena: Yeah.

Vice Mayor Lago: Let him keep going with his presentation. I don't want...

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: So, there is a question as to cost, relative cost, where you would have EV ready or EV capable. There is an additional cost. This additional cost assumes that there is existing sufficient electric service to the building. If that is -- if added service is required, then that means from the FPL side of the meter to the building, then that would add costs, and these costs could be significant, depending on the conditions that vary from site to site. But essentially, provided we have service to the site, EV capable would add 2 percent of the construction cost -- new construction cost of a parking structure, parking garage, and it's just the parking garage itself. It doesn't -- it's not 2 percent of the building, but you know, sometimes you have a building on a parking garage pedestal. No, this is just the parking garage cost, it's 2 percent. If it's EV ready, that would double to 4 percent. So, these costs can be somewhat significant. Alright, you also asked a question regarding parking requirements. And our Parking Director has weighed in and indicated that there would be no impact to parking requirements as a result of modifying the parking requirements for EV charging stations or EV spaces in a building. So, that would answer that question. We know that there are a number of current City charging infrastructure that are public and private. At this time, the City of Coral Gables has 22 charging points for Level III charging and 16 Level II charging points. In the future, we will be adding 12 Level II and 24 dual port charging stations. There are also 26 stations throughout the City that are privately owned. You asked a question regarding as to whether buildings that offered EV charging stations or EV charging spaces at any marked benefit in terms of lease ability or profitability. We've determined that, yes, it does add to added lease ability because folks that have electric vehicles would look at these buildings as an attractant. But it doesn't necessarily demonstratively translate to profitability. That analysis, we were not able to answer fully. So, right now -- and it's probably due to the fact that EVs are still low penetration into the market and most vehicles are gasoline powered. We conducted a City survey and this is an informal survey. You'll see the

results tabulated in your -- in the memo. And got some interesting information as to the number of different locations within the City -- and actually, one is outside the City, on Brickell Avenue, which is Panorama, where they also looked -- it shows the number of charging stations. I note that Panorama, which is an 80-story building, only has two charging stations for the entire building. It's pretty interesting.

City Manager Iglesias: 85.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: 80-story building -- 85?

City Manager Iglesias: 85.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: 85, my apologies. So, what's our recommendation. So, there are recent technological advances in the EV industry and these changes and advances are rapid and somewhat unpredictable. And there are also -- there's also the consideration that there's a significant impact to construction costs, as -- due to the result of EV charging requirements. So, these two factors weigh into our analysis. And in our opinion, we should be headed towards to the direction where new construction, whether it be residential or commercial buildings, when 20 or more off-street parking spaces, a minimum of 2 percent to 5 percent of the required off-street parking should be EV ready. In fact, probably -- it's good to consider that 2 percent be EV charging spaces already. The memo doesn't say that, but we -- after deliberating with staff this morning, we thought that it would be a good idea. And essentially, I would dovetail with what we already have in place as our existing Code. So, the question is whether we add another 3 percent as EV charging stations or EV capable to that number -- or EV ready, I'm sorry, to that number. And then, additionally, when there are also 20 or more off-street parking spaces, we would be looking at a minimum of 18 percent, depending on whether we have the 2 percent or the 5 percent or 15 percent of the required off-street parking as EV capable. Meaning -- and I know it's kind of complicated -- meaning that the infrastructure is in place to pull conductors into -- in the future,



add electrical service and have 20 percent of all the spaces in a building when that happens be EV ready.

Vice Mayor Lago: And what we would allow is what would happen is the growth would happen organically. So, you would pull the conduit as needed. You wouldn't put the charge upfront on a developer. You know, so you would go to 5 percent now, from 2 to 5. Once that's exhausted, you tell the individual that's interested and, you know, obviously can't find a parking space that's EV ready, you say, listen, we have the capability in the vault. We have the switch gear. We have everything that's required in regards to the panel. You just got to run your conduit. And then you can move in that direction, you know, hire an electrician, license and do the work that's necessary so you can hook up your charging station. My -- I just want to make you aware that, you know, obviously, I'm flexible. I just want to see a higher number, a threshold in regards to EV ready and EV capable. The County -- and maybe Ed can give a little more information -- the County's entertaining right now 10 percent EV ready. So, I think we've always been the leaders in this community.

Commissioner Mena: Yeah. They're also doing...

Vice Mayor Lago: Not saying that we need to go to 10 percent.

Commissioner Mena: Are you saying an additional EV capable number or just...

Vice Mayor Lago: That I don't know, that I don't know. But for me, when you used the example -- this is my last point. When you use the example of Panorama, which is 85 floors and there's a thousand people living in that building and you tell me that there's two charging stations, I think that's embarrassing.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: That is ridiculous.

Vice Mayor Lago: That's ridiculous.

Commissioner Keon: Well, yeah, but I think, at that point, you know, that building will respond to -- are they condos or rentals?

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: They're rentals.

Vice Mayor Lago: Rentals.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Entirely rentals.

Vice Mayor Lago: They're rentals. But the problem with that is that...

Commissioner Keon: They will respond to what the need is...

Commissioner Mena: The market.

Commissioner Keon: Within that building.

Vice Mayor Lago: But the problem...

Commissioner Keon: The market will drive that.

Vice Mayor Lago: The problem is that when you build these structures and you have your FP&L vault, there's only so much, you know, room. If you have to now -- if you have to bring in new gear that doesn't fit in that room...

Commissioner Keon: Yeah, but that's why...

Vice Mayor Lago: It's not that easy.

Commissioner Keon: No, but that's why the issue of -- is EV capable. Because if it's 20 percent EV capable...

Vice Mayor Lago: That's what I'm saying.

Commissioner Keon: It has to be...

Vice Mayor Lago: Yeah.

Commissioner Keon: The space has to be built into...

Vice Mayor Lago: The juice has to be there.

City Manager Iglesias: Yes.

Commissioner Keon: Well, the space has to be in there. Now, not necessarily that a transformer...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, the infrastructure.

Commissioner Keon: But they would have to have the space to bring in that additional transformer if there's a need for it. And you know, I -- living in a condo, in most condos that I am aware of usually assign parking spaces. And your condo docs generally include your parking spaces, so you own those parking spaces in addition to your unit. So, you would be -- I would think, particularly for condos, it is far better to have it capable so that you can run that charger to the spaces that you own, that are yours.

Commissioner Mena: Right. The problem there is -- I agree with you. But the problem is you're only going to have X percent capable. So, even then...

Commissioner Keon: Well, you'll have 20 percent capable, but I think in this day and age, I mean, that still is a significant...

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Commissioner Keon: I don't know what the...

Commissioner Mena: If you're assigned another space other than that 20 percent, you're still not...

Commissioner Keon: Well, but it's -- but if it's ready -- I mean, that's where I think it does affect your parking. I think if you have -- you know, you may not have to build it into whatever, but I think in practice it will affect you or your parking requirement because -- and I'm going to assume that the building has the ability to regulate the use of those stations that are ready, that you just can't, you know, pull in there and plug in your car for the night and that's your space when you have a whole bunch of other people. I mean, whether they're going to allow you to, you know, use it for two hours at a time or you have to -- I mean, I assume that it is the building property...

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: That's right, but...

Commissioner Keon: That's going to regulate the access to and use of those spaces. But they cannot become one of the required spaces in a building because it's -- people -- different people are using, you know, that same space and you're not using it for -- like, you know, I go away on vacation for two weeks and, you know, I'm going to plug my car in, and so, I plug my car in and go to the airport. You know, you're denying everybody else access to that. So, there has to be that parking space available to the residential community where you can leave your car for

whatever duration of time or, you know, you go on a business trip and you're gone for two days or whatever, you can have a place to park your car. When you come home, you may want to charge it, but you can't leave it charged for two days because you deny everybody else in the building the access to it. So, I think that in a practical sense, you're going to have to look at the availability of parking spaces, but you know, generally, that's going to be for a building to manage anyway.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: That's likely to be a building by building decision.

Commissioner Keon: Right.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: And I don't know if...

Commissioner Keon: The building will have to.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Because some buildings may have dedicated spaces for unit owners.

Commissioner Keon: Well, they do. I mean, I know at 100 Andalusia, just up the street here, that there is -- I think on two floors there's a parking space -- there's a charger on -- there's two chargers or two places where there's charging units.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. What's...

Commissioner Keon: None of them are the...

City Manager Iglesias: What happens...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: That issue is a different one...

Commissioner Keon: But none of them are the ones that are dedicated to...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Than what we're talking about. Commissioner...

Commissioner Keon: But none of them are dedicated to the individual -- to the condos themselves.

City Manager Iglesias: What happens, Commissioner, the fact that we have 20 percent capable...

Commissioner Keon: Yeah. That's why I think it's capable.

City Manager Iglesias: We have 2 to 5 percent ready, but that's a Level II charger.

Commissioner Keon: Right.

City Manager Iglesias: There's a huge difference in -- we have Level I, Level II and Level III, which is...

Vice Mayor Lago: Yeah.

City Manager Iglesias: A Tesla charger. So, our -- we're only saying 2 to 5 percent on Level II. You could put a lot more Level Is chargers in those 20 percent if you wish because that's not a -- one of our criteria. You could almost activate all of it without a substantial reduction. Now, that's a long-term charging solution. However, this gives you a lot of flexibility because the infrastructure is there and the retrofit is extremely expensive.

Commissioner Keon: But that's why I would rather...

City Manager Iglesias: So, you have a lot of flexibility there and you could use 5 Level IIs and you could put 15 Level Is.

Commissioner Keon: Right. But that's why I said I would rather...

City Manager Iglesias: Okay, so it's a lot of flexibility.

Commissioner Keon: See the 20 percent be capable and not ready.

Vice Mayor Lago: No, no, no. Okay, so this is what I'm proposing. I'm proposing that we have, obviously, the 5 percent EV ready and then 20 percent...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Will you make that motion?

Vice Mayor Lago: EV capable.

Commissioner Mena: He's saying 5 percent ready and...

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: 5 percent...

Commissioner Mena: The 15 percent balance...

Vice Mayor Lago: Yes.

Commissioner Mena: Capable, right?

Vice Mayor Lago: Capable.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Will you make that motion?

Commissioner Mena: That's what you're saying.

Vice Mayor Lago: That's my motion.

Commissioner Mena: But I guess -- I think the question is, what you're saying is that it should just be capable...

Vice Mayor Lago: All capable.

Commissioner Keon: Well, I mean, I think you can have 2 percent...

Commissioner Mena: And then let the...

Commissioner Keon: I think your recommendation is 2 percent.

Commissioner Mena: Building decide when they want to take it to the next step.

Vice Mayor Lago: I just want...

Commissioner Keon: Right. I mean, the other thing was -- their recommendation was 2 percent ready...

Commissioner Mena: Which we have already.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: 2 percent charge.

Commissioner Keon: 2 percent...



Commissioner Mena: They have already.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Already with chargers.

Commissioner Keon: On regular chargers.

Commissioner Mena: 2 percent, we have.

Commissioner Keon: They're working and whatever else. And then 20 percent...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah. The motion is...

Commissioner Keon: Capable.

Vice Mayor Lago: Yeah. And then just -- but just be aware.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: 5 percent ready...

Vice Mayor Lago: If that's what you want, I'll go with the will of the Commission. But I just want you to be aware, the County is moving in the direction of 10 percent.

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Commissioner Keon: Well, I think that that is...

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: May I recommend this? That we have 2 percent that are EV charging, meaning the charger is in place already. You have 3 percent that are EV ready.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Vice Mayor Lago: 3 percent? You and I discussed 5.

Commissioner Mena: That's what you're saying.

Commissioner Keon: Okay, go ahead.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Right, but that gives you 5.

Commissioner Mena: Plus 3.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: That gives you 5 total. You have one charge -- you have two charging and three ready...

Vice Mayor Lago: Okay.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Which is better than 5 ready.

Vice Mayor Lago: And then 15 percent more.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: And then 15 percent capable.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. There is a motion on the floor.

Vice Mayor Lago: That's the motion.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Is there a second?

Commissioner Keon: I'll second it.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. Will you call the roll, please?

Commissioner Keon: Yes.

Vice Mayor Lago: Yes.

Commissioner Mena: Yes.

Commissioner Quesada: Yes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

(Vote: 5-0)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: J-6.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: And by the way, regarding J-5, I want to express that that was a collaborative effort between Building, Public Works...

Commissioner Mena: Everybody.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Planning and Zoning. We got together and worked all this out.

Vice Mayor Lago: Can you do me a favor? Can you give me a breakdown of what we just voted on because I want to include it...

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Sure.

Vice Mayor Lago: On a few different emails I have to respond to people about exactly where we're headed because people were interested in...

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: So...

Vice Mayor Lago: In this legislation. I want to get the right numbers, everything and...

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: So, we're going to work with Law to draft up the Code amendment and move forward on that.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: J-6.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: J-6.

City Attorney Ramos: Yeah. Just to be clear, this ordinance will come back for first and second.

Vice Mayor Lago: Yes.

City Attorney Ramos: This is just direction on how to draft it.

Commissioner Mena: And Ed, you're saying, so I'm clear, 100 spaces, you have 2 that are already...

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Charging.

Commissioner Mena: Charged, 3 that are ready...

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Ready.

Commissioner Mena: And 15 that are capable.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Correct.

City Manager Iglesias: Correct.

Commissioner Mena: Okay.

Commissioner Keon: And the 20 percent capable -- oh, 15 percent capable.

Commissioner Mena: Right.

City Manager Iglesias: A total of 20 percent.

Commissioner Keon: Yes.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Okay.