



**City of Coral Gables  
CITY COMMISSION MEETING  
February 14, 2023**

**ITEM TITLE:**

Historic Preservation Board Meeting of November 16, 2022.

**SUMMARY OF MEETING:**

**OPENING STATEMENT:**

Chair Menendez read for the record the statement regarding the purpose of the board and lobbyist registration and disclosure.

**CALL TO ORDER:**

The meeting was called to order at 4:12 pm by Chair Menendez and attendance was stated for the record.

**NOTICE REGARDING EX-PARTE COMMUNICATIONS.**

Chair Menendez read a statement regarding Notice of Ex-Partee Communications. Board members who had ex-partee communication of contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact.

Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

**ANNOUNCEMENT OF DEFERRAL OF AN AGENDA ITEM:** None

**APPROVAL OF ABSENCES:**

A motion was made by Vice-Chair Garcia-Pons and seconded by Mr. Fullerton to excuse the absences of Ms. Bache-Wiig from this meeting.

The motion passed (Ayes: 8, Nays: 0).

**SWEARING IN OF THE PUBLIC:**

Assistant City Attorney Ceballos administered the oath.

**NEW BUSINESS:**

**CASE FILE US-2022-001:** A Resolution recommending the owner of 134 Florida Avenue, a Contributing Resource within the National and Local Register MacFarlane Homestead Subdivision Historic District, work with the Historic Preservation Office to restore and repair the structure or, if it is determined to be unsafe by the Building Official, demolish the structure and build a wood frame replica with salvaged material per the existing agreement.

A motion was made by Ms. Rolando and seconded by Mr. Fullerton to recommend that the property at 134 Florida Avenue a Contributing Resource within the National and Local Register MacFarlane Homestead Subdivision Historic District which has been determined to be an unsafe structure and should be demolished, shall meet the following conditions prior to demolition:

1. *There shall be measured detailed drawings of the structure, and all decorative details.*
2. *At the time of demolition, all salvageable materials and samples of the architectural details shall be salvaged, retained and stored by the City.*
3. *A restrictive covenant placed in the public records, indicating the requirement that any improvements to the property be an exact replica of the existing structure.*
4. *The City shall put a flag in its building records that no permit may be granted or issued on the property without the approval of Historic Preservation and the Building Official.*
5. *The listing broker/agent should be contacted and informed of this condition.*

The motion passed (Ayes: 8, Nays: 0).

**Request for a recommended Resolution:**

The Historic Preservation Board recommends to the City Commission an amendment to the Zoning Code that would authorize the City to file a notice in the public records to say:

*That if a property is designated historic, and there is a finding by the City that the property has violated the code, and is recommended for demolition due to neglect, and the property is subsequently demolished, the current property owner and/or subsequent owners shall be required to replace the demolished structure with a replica of the existing structure meeting the approval of the Historic Preservation Officer and the Historic Preservation Board.*

**CASE FILE AV 2019-003:** An application requesting ad valorem tax relief for the property at 1206 Cordova Street, a Local Historic Landmark, legally described as Lot 7 and the South ½ of Lot 8, Block 1, Granada Place Amended Plat, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 13, at Page 51 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The related Special Certificate of Appropriateness, COA (SP) 2017-015, was granted design approval by the Historic Preservation Board on August 17, 2017.

A motion was made by Mr. Fullerton and seconded by Ms. Rolando to approve the application requesting ad valorem tax relief for the property at 1206 Cordova Street.

The motion passed (Ayes: 8, Nays: 0).

**CASE FILE LHD 2022-005:** Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 1901 Le Jeune Road, legally described as Lots 1 & 2, Block 9, Coral Gables Section “K,” according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 33 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

A motion was made by Mr. Maxwell and seconded by Ms. Spain to approve the application for local historic designation of the property at 1901 Le Jeune Road, legally described as Lots 1 & 2, Block 9, Coral Gables Section “K,” according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 33 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida based on its historical, cultural and architectural significance and is associated in a significant way with the life or activities of a major historic person important in the past Miguel Jorge and Martha and Jesus Permuy.

The motion passed (Ayes: 8, Nays: 0).

**CASE FILE LHD 2022-008:** Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 117 Aledo Avenue, legally described as Lots 27, 28, 29 and 30, Block 14, Coral Gables Coconut Grove Section Part One, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 14, at Page 25 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

A motion was made by Mr. Maxwell and seconded by Mr. Fullerton to approve the application for local historic designation of the property at 117 Aledo Avenue, legally described as Lots 27, 28, 29 and 30, Block 14, Coral Gables Coconut Grove Section Part One, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 14, at Page 25 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida

The motion passed (Ayes: 8, Nays: 0).

**CASE FILE COA (SP) 2022-029:** An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 117 Aledo Avenue, a Local Historic Landmark, legally described as Lots 27, 28, 29 and 30, Block 14, Coral Gables Coconut Grove Section Part One, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 14, at Page 25 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for the demolition of the existing detached garage and carport, additions and alterations to the residence and sitework.

A motion was made by Mr. Maxwell and seconded by Ms. Rolando to approve the application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 117 Aledo Avenue, a Local Historic Landmark, legally described as Lots 27, 28, 29 and 30, Block 14, Coral Gables Coconut Grove Section Part One, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 14, at Page 25 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. To grant design approval for the demolition of the existing detached garage and carport, additions and alterations to the residence and sitework with the conditions noted by staff in the report with the exception of #1 and conditions added recommended by the Board. following conditions:

Staff conditions are as follows:

1. *The applicant shall clarify the proposed roofing tile type and submit to Staff for review.*
2. *Details and specifications of all doors, windows, chimney cap, railings, lighting fixtures, pavers, and architectural features shall be submitted to Staff for review.*
3. *Sills shall not be incorporated into the new construction to allow its differentiation from the historic structure.*
4. *Window glass shall be clear.*
5. *Muntins shall be high profile.*
6. *The stucco on the new additions shall be of a different texture to that of the historic structure to allow their differentiation from the historic structure.*

Board conditions are as follows:

1. *The owner restores the front and east facades to their original documented condition in consultation with the Historic Preservation Staff.*
2. *The garage placement and garage door be reconsidered, and the applicant work with the Historic Preservation Staff to come up with something mutually acceptable.*
3. *The proposed garage be setback (recessed) from the front façade. This would be worked out in conjunction with the Historic Preservation Staff.*

4. *The design of the proposed new studio be simplified, particularly the roof line so that it does not compete with the architecture of the home.*

The motion passed (Ayes: 8, Nays: 0).

The following additional amendments were made and added to the above motion:

1. *Simplify the proposed new studio, particularly the roof line, so that it doesn't compete with the architecture of the home.*
2. *The new garage would be pushed back some distance from the front to be worked out with the Historic Preservation Staff.*

**CASE FILE LHD 2022-010:** Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 430 Minorca Avenue, legally described as Lot 5, Block 4, Coral Gables Section “B,” according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 111 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

A motion was made by Mr. Maxwell and seconded by Mr. Fullerton to approve the application for local historic designation of the property located at 430 Minorca Avenue, legally described as Lot 5, Block 4, Coral Gables Section “B,” according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 111 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

The motion passed (Ayes: 8, Nays: 0).

**CASE FILE COA (SP) 2022-030:** An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 1101 Alhambra Circle, a Contributing Resource within the “Alhambra Circle Historic District,” legally described as Lot 13, Block 16, Coral Gables Section “C,” according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 26 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for the alteration of the roof rafter tails and the demolition and reconstruction of the east property wall.

A motion was made by Mr. Maxwell and seconded by Mr. Ehrenhaft to approve the issuance of the Special Certificate of Appropriateness to approve the demolition and reconstruction of the east property wall on the property at 1101 Alhambra Circle, a Contributing Resource within the “Alhambra Circle Historic District,” legally described as Lot 13, Block 16, Coral Gables Section “C,” according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 26 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida and to deny the request for design approval for the alteration of the roof rafter tails with the recommendation that the existing rafter tails be restored in concert and with the assistance of City Staff.

The motion passed (Ayes: 8, Nays: 0).

**CASE FILE TDR 2022-010:** Consideration of the Transfer of Development Rights for the property at 114 Menores Avenue, legally described as Lot 8 and the West ½ of Lot 9, Block 36, Coral Gables Douglas Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 25, Page 69 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests approval of the maintenance/preservation plan, pursuant to section 14-204.4 of the Zoning Code.

A motion was made by Mr. Garcia-Pons and seconded by Ms. Spain to extend the meeting until 9:30 pm.

The motion was unanimously approved.

A motion was made by Mr. Garcia-Pons and seconded by Mr. Ehrenhaft to extend the meeting another fifteen minutes.

The motion was unanimously approved.

A motion was made by Ms. Rolando and seconded by Vice-Chair Garcia- Pons to approve the maintenance/preservation plan for the property at 114 Menores Avenue, legally described as Lot 8 and the West ½ of Lot 9, Block 36, Coral Gables Douglas Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 25, Page 69 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. With the following conditions:

1. *Property Conditions of the report being modified after consultation and approval with Staff to include outside dates for each of the immediate and intermediate repairs and future improvements.*
2. *Provided that the report shall call for the replacement of the windows no later than two (2) years.*
3. *The modifications must be accepted and acceptable to staff.*
4. *The annual reports must be submitted to staff every two years on the building system life cycle, the maintenance and stabilization performed during the previous year and additional repairs, maintenance or replacement that need to be made.*

The motion passed (Ayes: 7, Nays: 1).

**CASE FILE TA-2022-002:** Recommendation to the City Commission of Coral Gables, Florida providing for text amendments to the City of Coral Gables Official Zoning Code by amending Article 15, "Notices" to require online publication of historical determination letters and Article 8, "Historic Preservation" revising the process of historical determination letters; providing for severability clause, repealer provision, codification, and providing for an effective date.

A motion was made by Ms. Spain and seconded by Mr. Maxell to approve the recommendation to the City Commission of Coral Gables, Florida providing for text amendments to the City of Coral Gables Official Zoning Code by amending Article 15, "Notices" to require online publication of historical determination letters and Article 8, "Historic Preservation" revising the process of historical determination letters; providing for severability clause, repealer provision, codification, and providing for an effective date.

The motion passed (Ayes: 8, Nays: 0).

#### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**

A motion was made by Vice-Chair Garcia-Pons and seconded by Mr. Maxwell to approve the minutes of the October 19, 2022, meeting with corrections.

**DISCUSSION ITEMS:**

1. Reconstruction of the Gondola Building on the grounds of the Biltmore Hotel.

**ADDITIONAL ITEM BROUGHT UP BY BOARD MEMBER:**

1. The Garden and the Church of St. James, the Lutheran Church at Galiano and Phoenetia are being demolished.

This item was not discussed.

**OLD BUSINESS:** None

**NEW BUSINESS:** None

**ADJOURNMENT:**

A motion was made by Vice-Chair Garcia Pons and seconded by Ms. Spain to adjourn the meeting.

The motion passed with a collective aye.

The meeting was adjourned at 9:50 pm.