City of Coral Gables

405 Biltmore Way Coral Gables, FL 33134 www.coralgables.com



Meeting Minutes

Thursday, December 19, 2024

3:00 PM

Police and Fire Headquarters, Community Meeting Room

Historic Preservation Board

Chairperson Michael J. Maxwell
Vice Chairperson Alejandro Silva
Board Member Ana Alvarez
Board Member Javier Banos
Board Member Michelle Cuervo Dunaj
Board Member Xavier F. Durana
Board Member Cesar Garcia-Pons
Board Member Margaret Rolando
Board Member Dona Spain

The Historic Preservation Board will be holding its Regular Meeting on December 19, 2024, commencing at 3:00 pm EST.

Pursuant to Resolution No. 2021-118, the City of Coral Gables has returned to traditional in-person meetings.

Accordingly, any individual wishing to provide sworn testimony shall be present physically in the Commission Chambers. However, the Historic Preservation Board has established the ability for the public to provide comments (non-sworn and without evidentiary value) virtually.

Accordingly, only individuals who wish to provide public comment in this format, may appear and provide those comments via Zoom.

Members of the public may join the meeting via Zoom at https://us06web.zoom.us/j/88413827534.

In addition, a dedicated phone line will be available so that any individual who does not wish (or is unable) to use Zoom may listen to and participate in the meeting.

Join Zoom Meeting

https://us06web.zoom.us/j/88413827534

Meeting ID: 884 1382 7534

One tap mobile

- +17866351003,,88413827534# US (Miami)
- +16465189805,,88413827534# US (New York)

Dial by your location

- +1 786 635 1003 US (Miami)
- +1 646 518 9805 US (New York)
- +1 929 205 6099 US (New York)
- +1 312 626 6799 US (Chicago)
- +1 470 381 2552 US (Atlanta)

Meeting ID: 884 1382 7534

Find your local number: https://us06web.zoom.us/u/kbrgrlLN6G

305-461-6769 (Coral Gables local number)

To speak to the Historic Preservation Board on an Agenda Item, please "Raise your Hand" or send a message to one of the meeting hosts using the Zoom Platform.

If you joined the meeting via telephone, you can "Raise your hand" by pressing *9.

I. CALL TO ORDER

This meeting was Called to Order at 3:04 PM by Chairperson Maxwell.

Staff Present:

Anna Pernas, Director
Kara Kautz, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Stephanie Throckmorton, Deputy City Attorney
Amos Rojas, Jr. City Manager
Joe Gomez, Assistant City Manager
Hermes Diaz, Public Works Director

II. ROLL CALL

Present: 8 - Board Member Durana, Board Member Alvarez, Board Member Banos, Board

Member Rolando, Board Member Spain, Vice Chairperson Silva, Chairperson

Maxwell and Board Member Garcia-Pons

Excused: 1 - Board Member Cuervo Dunaj

III. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

1. 24-8420 Historic Preservation Board Meeting Minutes for October 16, 2024

A motion was made by Board Member Banos, seconded by Board Member Garcia-Pons, to approve the minutes for the October 16, 2024, Historic Preservation Board meeting. This motion passed by the following vote:

Yeas: 8 - Board Member Durana, Board Member Alvarez, Board Member Banos, Board

 ${\it Member\ Rolando, Board\ Member\ Spain, Vice\ Chairperson\ Silva, Chairperson\ Chairperson\$

Maxwell and Board Member Garcia-Pons

Excused: 1 - Board Member Cuervo Dunaj

2. <u>24-8421</u> Historic Preservation Board Meeting Minutes for November 20, 2024

A motion was made by Board Member Banos, seconded by Board Member Garcia-Pons, to approve the minutes for the November 20, 2024, Historic Preservation Board meeting. This motion passed by the following vote:

 $\textbf{Yeas:} \quad \textbf{8-} \quad \textbf{Board Member Durana,} \\ \textbf{Board Member Alvarez,} \\ \textbf{Board Member Banos,} \\ \textbf{Board Member Banos,} \\ \textbf{Board Member Banos,} \\ \textbf{Board Member Durana,} \\ \textbf{Board Member Banos,} \\ \textbf{Board Member Banos,$

Member Rolando, Board Member Spain, Vice Chairperson Silva, Chairperson

Maxwell and Board Member Garcia-Pons

Excused: 1 - Board Member Cuervo Dunaj

IV. CITY COMMISSION ITEM

3:11 PM - Board Members left the room to view the sample of the proposed window replacement for City Hall. No discussions occurred during this break.

3:17 PM - Board Members have returned and meeting resumes.

1. <u>24-8422</u>

Historic Preservation Board review of the window replacement proposal for the City Hall Complex

Ms. Pernas read from the Staff Analysis as the PowerPoint presentation played on screen.

Presentation on Windows:

Natividad Soto, President - Ferguson, Glasgow, Schuster, Soto, Inc. Claudia Noval, Project Architect - Ferguson, Glasgow, Schuster, Soto, Inc. Amos Rojas, Jr. City Manager Joe Gomez, Assistant City Manager Hermes Diaz, Public Works Director

Please refer to Exhibit A attached for the verbatim transcript.

Public Comment Received by Staff:

Karelia Carbonell on behalf of the Historic Preservation Association of Coral Gables

Public Comment:

Venny Torre, Torre Companies & Development

A motion was made by Board Member Banos, seconded by Board Member Garcia-Pons, to defer this item for additional information about the windows and doors to be provided by the city and that it will not proceed to the City Commission until further review by this Board. This motion passed by the following vote:

Yeas: 8 - Board Member Durana,Board Member Alvarez,Board Member Banos,Board Member Rolando,Board Member Spain,Vice Chairperson Silva,Chairperson Maxwell and Board Member Garcia-Pons

Excused: 1 - Board Member Cuervo Dunaj

V. CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

- Concluding the statement on Ex-Parte Communications, Chairperson Maxwell invited the Board Members and the public to view the mock-up of a window proposed for City Hall.
- 2. The Staff received a request to hear the City Commission Item City Hall Windows item as the first item in the Agenda.

VI. PUBLIC HEARING

VII. LOCAL HISTORIC DESIGNATIONS

1. 24-8411

CASE FILE LHD 2024-013: Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at **720 Madeira Avenue**, legally described as Lot 7, Block 7, Coral Estates Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 19, at Page 7, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Ms. Guin read from the Staff Report as the PowerPoint presentation played on screen.

On Behalf of the Applicant:

The Property Owner, Venny Torre, Torre Companies & Development, was present and stated his support of the application.

Letters of Support Received by Staff:

Ellen Dyer, Vicki Cerda, Bruce Fitzgerald, Maribel Biamon, and Karelia Carbonell on behalf of the Historic Preservation Association of Coral Gables.

A motion was made by Board Member Garcia-Pons, seconded by Board Member Rolando, to approve the Local Historic Designation of the property at 720 Madeira Avenue (legally described as Lot 7, Block 7, Coral Estates Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 19, at Page 7, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida) based on its historical, cultural, and architectural significance in accordance with Article 8, Section 8-103 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code. This motion passed by the following vote:

Yeas: 8 - Board Member Durana,Board Member Alvarez,Board Member Banos,Board Member Rolando,Board Member Spain,Vice Chairperson Silva,Chairperson Maxwell and Board Member Garcia-Pons

CASE FILE LHD 2024-002: Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at **3519 Toledo Street**, legally described as Lots 18 & 19, Block 40, Coral Gables Country Club Section Part Three, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 10, at Page 52, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Ms. Pernas read from the Staff Report as the PowerPoint presentation played on screen.

For the Property Owner:

Followed by a presentation by the Owner's representative, Mr. Zeke Guilford, Guilford & Associates and their Expert Witness, Mr. Steve Avdakov, Heritage Architectural Associates.

Letters of Support Received by Staff:

Jamie & Zully Pardo, Vicki Cerda, Ellen Dyer, Maribel Biamon, Bruce Fitzgerald, Daniel Ciraldo on behalf of the Miami Design Preservation League and Karelia Carbonell on behalf of the Historic Preservation Association of Coral Gables.

A motion was made by Board Member Garcia-Pons, seconded by Board Member Banos, to approve the Local Historic Designation of the property at 3519 Toledo Street based on its historical, cultural, and architectural significance, specifically criterion number 4, exemplifies the historic, cultural, political, economic, and social trends of the community, architectural significance number one, portrays the environment in an area of history characterized by one or more distinctive architectural styles, specifically, Art Moderne and Mediterranean Revival and architectural number two, embodies those distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or period or method of construction based on the substantial competent evidence presented by Staff and particularly the second paragraph of the summary statement of significance. This motion passed by the following vote:

Yeas: 8 - Board Member Durana, Board Member Alvarez, Board Member Banos, Board Member Rolando, Board Member Spain, Vice Chairperson Silva, Chairperson Maxwell and Board Member Garcia-Pons

Excused: 1 - Board Member Cuervo Dunaj

7:00 PM - Break

7:09 PM - Meeting Resumes

VIII. SPECIAL CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATNESS

1. 24-8413

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2024-035 an application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **1200 Anastasia Avenue**, the Biltmore Hotel, a Local and National Historic Landmark, a lengthy legal description is on file in the Historical Resources Department. The applicant is requesting design approval for the demolition and reconstruction of the Gondola Building.

Ms. Pernas read from the Staff Report as the PowerPoint presentation played on screen.

On Behalf of the Applicant: Daphne Gurri, Gurrimatute

Letters of Support Received by Staff

Karelia Carbonell on behalf of the Historic Preservation Association of Coral Gables

A motion was made by Board Member Garcia-Pons, seconded by Board Member Durana to approve the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 1200 Anastasia Avenue, the Biltmore Hotel, a Local and National Historic Landmark, for the demolition and reconstruction of the Gondola Building, including salvaging and reusing of any salvageable elements. This motion passed by the following vote:

Yeas: 8 - Board Member Durana,Board Member Alvarez,Board Member Banos,Board Member Rolando,Board Member Spain,Vice Chairperson Silva,Chairperson Maxwell and Board Member Garcia-Pons

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2024-037: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **809 Coral Way**, a Contributing Resource within the "Coral Way Historic District," legally described as Lots 12 & E 20' Lot 13, Block 34, Coral Gables Section B, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 111 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for the addition of an elevator at the rear.

Ms. Kautz read from the Staff Report as the PowerPoint presentation played on screen.

On Behalf of the Property Owner: Albert Rodriguez, Dalima Studio Architecture Inc.

A motion was made by Board Member Banos, seconded by Board Member Spain, to approve the design proposal for the addition and alterations to the residence at 809 Coral Way, a Contributing Resource within the Coral Way Historic District, legally described as Lots 12, 13 and 14, Block 34, Coral Gables Granada Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 111, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida, and approve the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness. This motion passed by the following vote:

Yeas: 8 - Board Member Durana,Board Member Alvarez,Board Member Banos,Board Member Rolando,Board Member Spain,Vice Chairperson Silva,Chairperson Maxwell and Board Member Garcia-Pons

3. <u>24-8415</u>

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2024-034: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **1203 North Greenway Drive**, a Contributing Resource within the "Country Club of Coral Gables Historic District," legally described as Lots 17 & 18 to 114, Block 4, Coral Gables Section E, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 13 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for grey tinted glass windows.

Applicant was not present.

A motion was made by Board Member Rolando, seconded by Board Member Silva, to defer this item to the January 16, 2025, Historic Preservation Board Meeting. This motion passed by the following vote:

Yeas: 8 - Board Member Durana,Board Member Alvarez,Board Member Banos,Board Member Rolando,Board Member Spain,Vice Chairperson Silva,Chairperson Maxwell and Board Member Garcia-Pons

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2024-004: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **3800 Granada Boulevard**, a Local Historic Landmark, legally described as Lots 112 to 114 & the South 20 Feet of Lot 115, Block 50, Coral Gables Country Club Section Part Four, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 10, at Page 57 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for additions and alterations to the residence and sitework.

Ms. Kautz read from the Staff Report as the PowerPoint presentation played on screen.

For the Applicant: Yasmin & Walter Gonzalez (Applicant/Owners) Oscar Carrera, Architect, Colin Brown, Landscape Architect

A motion was made by Board Member Spain, seconded by Board Member Banos, to approve with conditions 1 through 22 as noted in the Staff report, the design proposal for the addition and alterations to the residence at 3800 Granada Boulevard, and approve the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness, condition six, work with Staff to determine if the arched leaded glass on the front window is to remain, and condition thirteen, the metal roofs for the rear covered terrace and the semi-circular connector to the storage room cannot be copper, the stepped up roof needs to be studied, storage room addition at the front façade is to be lowered to be below the eve of the existing garage structure which is acceptable, that the proposed grading be further studied and that further clarification of the infill proposed at the arched entryway also be discussed with Staff. This motion passed by the following vote:

Yeas: 8 - Board Member Durana, Board Member Alvarez, Board Member Banos, Board Member Rolando, Board Member Spain, Vice Chairperson Silva, Chairperson Maxwell and Board Member Garcia-Pons

5. <u>24-8417</u>

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2024-026: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **909 N Greenway Drive**, a Contributing Resource within the "Country Club of Coral Gables Historic District," legally described as Lots 35 & 36, Block 32, Coral Gables Section B, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 111 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for additions and alterations to the residence and sitework.

Ms. Pernas read from the Staff Report as the PowerPoint presentation played on screen.

On Behalf of the Applicant: William H. Arthur, Architect Michael Sheehan, Owner

A motion was made by Board Member Garcia-Pons seconded by Board Member Durana, to approve the design proposal for additions and alterations to the residence and sitework on the property located at 909 North Greenway Drive and approve with the conditions noted in the Staff report in addition to removal of the chamfer on the new addition, make it a single edge, and work with Staff to enlarge or re-think the window above the arch facing the front elevation and approve the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness. This motion passed by the following vote:

Yeas: 6 - Board Member Durana,Board Member Rolando,Board Member Spain,Vice Chairperson Silva,Chairperson Maxwell and Board Member Garcia-Pons

Nays: 2 - Board Member Alvarez and Board Member Banos

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2024-036 an application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **2701 Indian Mound Trail**, a Contributing Resource within the "Church of the Little Flower Historic District," legally described as ALL Blocks 6-6-A & 7, Coral Gables Section D, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 25, at Page 74 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the new construction of a one-story, approximately 19,123 square foot, multi-purpose building.

Ms. Pernas read from the Staff Report as the PowerPoint presentation played on screen.

For The Applicant: Suzanne Dockerty, J. Patrick Fitzgerald & Associates Michael Ehrling, Zyscovich Architects

A motion was made by Board Member Banos, seconded by Board Member Rolando, to approve the design proposal for the new construction of a one-story, approximately 19,123 square foot, multi-purpose building on the property located at 2701 Indian Mound Trail, a Contributing Resource within the "Church of the Little Flower Historic District," legally described as All of Blocks 6-6-A & 7, Coral Gables Section "D," according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 25, at Page 74, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida, approve with the conditions in the Staff report one through seven and look at the detailing carefully and approve the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness. This motion passed by the following vote:

Yeas: 8 - Board Member Durana,Board Member Alvarez,Board Member Banos,Board Member Rolando,Board Member Spain,Vice Chairperson Silva,Chairperson Maxwell and Board Member Garcia-Pons

IX. OLD BUSINESS

X. NEW BUSINESS

XI. DISCUSSION ITEMS

- 1. 2025 Meeting Dates Meeting dates for 2025 will be on second and third Thursday of the month. Board Members may have an issue with Thursdays.
- 2. CMR Board Member Rolando requested improvements to the audio visual and placement of screens.
- 3. Mediterranean Moderne Board Members requested Staff to study this and clarify.
- 4. City Hall Board Members requested Staff investigate the process for National Landmark Designation for City Hall. Is it possible for this to happen by the centennial.
- 5. TDR Commissioners and the public are interested in expanding the TDR receiving and sending sites. Will discuss at the January meeting.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

This meeting was Adjourned at 8:59 PM.

NOTE