



# The City of Coral Gables

Historical Resources Department

## CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 21, 2014, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:	S	O	N	D	J	F	M	A	M	J	J	A	APPOINTED BY:
	13	13	13	13	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	
Dorothy Thomson	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	-	P	P	P	P	Mayor Jim Cason
Margaret Rolando	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	-	P	P	P	P	Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Alejandro Silva	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	-	P	P	P	P	Commissioner Patricia Keon
Venny Torre	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	-	E	P	P	P	Commissioner Frank C. Quesada
Tony Newell	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	-	P	P	E	P	Commissioner Vince Lago
Carmen Guerrero	P	P	E	E	E	P	P	-	P	P	P	E	Historic Preservation Board
Robert Parsley*							P	-	P	P	P	P	City Manager
Dolly MacIntyre	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	-	P	P	P	P	City Commission
Judy Pruitt	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	-	P	P	E	P	City Commission

### STAFF:

Dona Spain, Historic Preservation Officer  
Kara N. Kautz, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer  
Yesenia Diaz, Administrative Assistant  
Bridgette Thornton, Deputy City Attorney

A = Absent  
P = Present  
E = Excused  
\* = New Member  
^ = Resigned Member  
- = No Meeting

GUESTS: Joseph T. Monagle, Jr., Rita Gross, Marcia M. Borden, Joseph Fadel, Naomi Harrison, James Piersol, Lis Ferrer, Maggie Uribarri, Tere Seifert, Angela Monagle, Grettel Duran, Zeke Guilford, Marshall Bellin, Dean Warhaft, Sylvia Fernandez, Vicky Rua, Javier Salman, Alex Adams, Jose Feria, Alicia Kossick

RECORDING AND PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Torre at 4:03 p.m. A quorum was present.

### MINUTES: MEETING OF JULY 17, 2014:

A motion made by Ms. MacIntyre to approve the minutes of the July 17, 2014 meeting were unanimously approved by voice vote.

### MEETING ATTENDANCE:

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion, seconded by Mr. Silva to excuse the absence of Ms. Guerrero from today's meeting. The motion was unanimously approved by voice vote.

### DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Mr. Torre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. Board members who had ex parte communication or contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 21, 2014

Continued

DEFERRALS: Ms. Spain reported the following case deferrals: Case File COA (SP) 2014-005 – Continued, 1258 Obispo Avenue; Case File COA (SP) 2014-009, 1217, 1223, 1228 and 1238 Dickinson Drive.

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Ms. Morgan administered the public swearing in for those testifying during the meeting.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

Ms. Rolando arrived at 4:10 p.m.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2014-007: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the Venetian Pool, located at 2701 De Soto Boulevard, a Local and National Historic Landmark, legally described as Lot 1 less part described in DB 3865-329 and All of Lot 2 and All of Lot 3 less Beginning of the Northwest corner South 26.12ft East 25 feet of Northerly To Northeast corner West to Point of Beginning and Plot Described as Sevilla Park, Block 6, Coral Gables Section “A,” according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 102, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for restoration and renovations to the property.

Ms. Kautz displayed historic and current photographs as she briefly relayed the Venetian Pool’s history, reviewed the site and presented an overview of the application.

Ms. Harrison, project manager (MC Harry Associates), comprehensively detailed and displayed all areas of the pool, building and site to be repaired or replaced, including ADA compliance elements. After concluding her presentation, Ms. Harrison engaged in lengthy discussion with the Board and staff.

During discussion, general agreement was reached about the following:

- The existing paint on the windows will be scraped down to investigate the original paint color, and the findings will be reported back to the Board.
- Regarding paint color for the pool coating, aqua-tinted (as well as white and gray) large panel samples will be created and placed in the pool for review by the Board of Architects (BOA) and Historic Preservation Board. When sand is removed from the “beach area,” the paint color on the concrete under the sand may be original; if so, the color can be replicated.
- The walkways and patio floor areas are not original. Real keystone will not be used on these walkways and patio floor areas due to the irregularity of keystone surfaces, related safety issues and cost.
- Window paint color, pool finish color and paver selection will be resubmitted for approval to the Board and the BOA.
- The proposed roof replacement tiles will be tested for possible fabrication issues. Ms. Harrison will further investigate roof tile.
- Detailed shop drawings will be prepared for all design elements.
- Materials for the walkway around the pool perimeter will be a “soda finish” continuous pour concrete sidewalk, which lends itself to a curvilinear layout.
- The “beach” will be Lake Wales silica sand (12 inches thick, coarse grade, white to light gray) for the top coat, with the base layer stable-filled, not compacted.
- Ms. Harrison was commended for the excellence of the architectural drawings.

Mr. Torre invited audience comment. Hearing no requests for further input, he closed the public hearing.

Mr. Parsley made a motion to approve issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the restoration and renovations of the Venetian Pool located at 2701 De Soto Boulevard with the following conditions: salvage as many existing roof tiles as possible to be used as “cap” tiles when the building is reroofed; the “beach” area is to be Lake Wales silica sand (12” thick, coarse grade, white to light gray) for the top coat, with the base layer stable-filled, not compacted; provide aqua tints for the pool bottom samples (in addition to white and gray) for review by

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 21, 2014

Continued

the BOA and the Historic Preservation Board; provide a sample of the replacement terracotta tile pavers to be examined for approval; and the walkway around the pool perimeter should be a “soda finish” continuous pour concrete sidewalk – sample panels to be provided for staff approval prior to construction. Ms. MacIntyre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Newell, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2014-010: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 42 Navarre Avenue, a Local Historic Landmark, legally described as Lot 2, Block 15, Coral Gables Section “L,” according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 85, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the construction of a 16-story building on the remainder of the block. A variance has been requested from Article 4, Section 4-302(D)(4) and Article 5, Section 5-604 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code for floor area ratio in order to exclude the floor area of the historic building (approximately 2,000 square feet) in the calculations for the project (33 Alhambra Circle).

Ms. Spain reviewed the background of the property, and stated that the applicant requested approval of a variance to allow the floor area of the existing Local Historic Landmark building (approximately 2,000 square feet) to be excluded in the F.A.R. calculations for the project at 33 Alhambra Circle. Ms. Spain concluded her presentation by stating staff’s recommendation in favor of the variance and the building design.

Mr. Guilford, representing TWJ Alhambra, LLC, said that Dean Warhaft, representing the owner, and Marshall Bellin, project architect, were also present. Mr. Guilford advised the Board that its scope was to examine how the development is in harmony with the historic building, as well as the requested variance. He displayed several property drawings and site plans as he described the property and pointed out design elements. He noted the historic house as it is situated within the development plan, and demonstrated how features and the scale of the historic building were reflected throughout the design of the live/work units in the new building. He described the challenges experienced in designing the new building around the historic building, including accommodations for adequate parking. He discussed the need for the variance, and asked that the 2000 square feet in the historic house be excluded from new building’s square footage allowance.

City Attorney Craig Leen stated his opinion that the applicant’s request was appropriate in these circumstances and said he agreed with the analysis presented by Mr. Guilford in his June 25, 2014 letter (entered in record) regarding this issue. Mr. Leen said the situation was unique, and opined that it would be a hardship to count total F.A.R. in this instance.

In response to Ms. Thomson’s question about how the developer would proceed if the 2,000 square feet (SF) were not excluded, Mr. Leen said that retention of the historic building was a benefit to the public and the developer should not be penalized for preserving it. Mr. Guilford verified that the issue from the developer’s viewpoint was building a 170,000 SF building or a 172,000 SF.

Mr. Torre invited public comment.

Public Hearing:

Mr. Fadel, 1 Alhambra Circle: Mr. Fadel’s August 19, 2014 email letter of objection to the project was made part of the record. He verbally objected to a 16-story building in his residential neighborhood, and opposed approval of a variance.

Ms. Gross, 2030 South Douglas Road: Ms. Gross expressed concern about a 16-story building in the neighborhood, its proximity to a school, the impacts of traffic and on the environment. She opposed the variance and proposed project, and urged the Board to deny the variance and not allow the 16-story building.

Ms. Fernandez, Attorney for Villa Alhambra Condominium, 50 Alhambra Circle: She said the owners had only nine days’ notice of the meeting, and requested a deferral of the application to give them time to consult with legal counsel.

## CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 21, 2014

Continued

Ms. Seifert, 50 Alhambra Circle: Ms. Seifert stated that the neighborhood was a low/medium density area, asked the Board to maintain the consistency and quality of the neighborhood, and opposed the requested variance, stating that it would open the door to a future zoning and land use change.

Mr. Monagle, 50 Alhambra Circle: Mr. Monagle said he did not receive mailed notice 10 days prior to the meeting. He said he asked the condominium attorney to secure an attorney who understands land use issues. He commented that added traffic would negatively impact the children and the school, and necessitate traffic lights. He objected to the proposed variance and advised that litigation would ensue against the city if the "building goes up." He urged the Board to deny the variance, and said the matter should be deferred as neighbors did not have proper notice.

Ms. Spain stated that City Attorney advised her that he interpreted the notice mailing regulation to mean that as long as the notice was mailed 10 days prior to a scheduled meeting, notice was sufficient. Ms. Spain also said for the record that she received letters from Rita Gross and Marcia M. Borden in addition to the email from Mr. Fadel, and assured them that if the application would be heard by the Planning and Zoning Board, their letters would be forwarded to that board and become part of its meeting record as well.

Ms. Uribarri, President of Villa Alhambra Condominium, 50 Alhambra Circle: Ms. Uribarri stated that the City's letter was dated August 11<sup>th</sup>, mailed the 12<sup>th</sup> and received the 13<sup>th</sup>. On behalf of the condominium, she opposed the building, and said they needed legal counsel to fight it. She emphasized the impact it would have on children and the school.

Deputy City Attorney Thornton: Ms. Thornton stated that notice of the meeting was also properly published and posted according to regulations, adding that notice begins when the mailing is taken to the Post Office.

Alex Adams, 36 Palermo Avenue: Mr. Adams proposed solutions he believed would be acceptable to the developer, the neighbors and the City. He recalled hearing the developer's presenter say that adding the historic building to the project generated the need to add another parking level. He made a few suggestions: to approve a parking waiver if the developer agreed, which would reduce the scale of the building; and suggested that, at the frieze level, parking could be set in at least one space to give more setback and separation from the historic structure and the new structure. Additionally, he said if the garage would be open ventilated, quality screening on the openings would mask mechanical equipment, cars and lights at night.

Mr. Guilford pointed out that the proposed project was not new, had been ongoing for over a year and a half, and was posted and properly noticed for meetings of the Development Review Committee, the Board of Architects and the Historic Preservation Board. He urged the Board to support the recommendation of staff to approve the application.

Mr. Monagle urged the Board to defer the application if the two attorneys (Ms. Fernandez and Mr. Leen) disagreed about the legal notice issue. He said it should be settled in court.

Mr. Torre advised that the Board relied on the opinions of the City Attorney, and said those who objected to any decision of the Board could appeal the decision to the City Commission. Mr. Leen restated that the envelope was postmarked nine days in advance of the meeting, and delivered an unrequired courtesy notice to neighbors. Ms. Spain advised that an employee delivered the mail to the Post Office, after the City's postage machine marked the envelopes. Mr. Leen examined the mark on the envelope and said he would research to determine if the mark was made by the City or the Post Office. He advised the Board it was legally permissible to proceed with the meeting, and said and it wasn't necessary to defer based on the courtesy notice issue.

Mr. Torre commented that the issues concerning the neighbors seemed to be related more to the Zoning Board rather than the Historic Preservation Board. Mr. Newell suggested consideration of deferral and Ms. Rolando agreed. Mr. Torre commented that if the developer would shrink the building by six inches, they would capture the additional 2,000 SF.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 21, 2014

Continued

General discussion continued, until Ms. MacIntyre suggested a motion to deny the variance. Mr. Leen advised the Board not to deny the variance based on the notice issue, re-stating that the variance/notice issues were separate.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to defer approval of issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 42 Navarre Avenue, defer approval of the design proposal for the construction of a 16-story building as described in the written report, and defer approval of a variance as requested. Ms. Pruitt seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Newell, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt. Nays: Mr. Parsley, Mr. Torre.

STANDARD CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (ST) 2014-087: An application for the issuance of a Standard Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 5129 Riviera Drive, a contributing resource within the “Chinese Village Historic District,” legally described as Lot 14 and North ½ of Lot 12, Block 100, Coral Gables Riviera Section Part 2, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 28, Page at 18 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the installation of a new roof using Santafé Tile Corporation clay “S” tiles (color: Ultramarine).

Ms. Kautz displayed photographs of the property as well as other homes in the Chinese Village, focusing on their roof applications. She said staff did not object to the use of S tile for the property’s roof, but was recommending a specific S tile with a tulip detail, which is on several other roofs in the Village. The clay S tile with the tulip detail is manufactured by MCA and, to ensure uniformity in the Village, staff wants the tulip detail incorporated in the roof.

Mr. Feria, Palmer Roofing Company, and Ms. Kossick, representing the homeowner (her sister), addressed the Board. Mr. Feria explained his reasons for proposing the Santafé-manufactured tile, described different types of decorative ridges, and tile applications on other Village roofs. He and Ms. Kossick expressed their preference for the Santafé S tile with a decorative ridge. Roof tile samples were displayed.

During their discussion, Ms. Kossick relayed a conversation with a neighbor about Village roof applications, and also compared the similarities of the Santafé S tile to the Ludowici, and pointed out the big price difference between the two and the even greater cost of MCA tile. She and Mr. Feria each emphasized their interest in maintaining the historic appearance of the house.

In response to Mr. Silva’s inquiry about installing either a Ludowici or MCA crown, Mr. Feria expressed willingness to do so if acceptable.

Mr. Torre urged Ms. Kossick to favor authenticity for a house he predicted would be the “jewel of the neighborhood,” and Ms. Rolando also strongly encouraged her to reconsider her choice. Ms. Kossick agreed that the MCA tile was superior, but was not convinced. Issues were explored between the Board and staff about undue hardship, ad valorem tax relief and their respective applications and regulations.

As discussion continued, Mr. Feria proposed using the big S tile, putting in a decorative crown with MCA tile and finishing it with the decorative tiles. He mentioned that Ms. Spain suggested using MCA on the eyebrow roof over the front door. Mr. Feria said the MCA tile is a gloss finish, and the Ludowici is a satin/matte finish. Mr. Torre again urged Ms. Kossick to use the most authentic and highest quality tile.

If the house needed a lot of restoration work done, Ms. Kautz said the property would be reassessed and, if so, the ad valorem tax relief process would be worthwhile, and she explained the benefits, stating that the roof could be the beginning of the process.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 21, 2014

Continued

Ms. Thomson made a motion to approve issuance of a Standard Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 5129 Riviera Drive for installation of a new roof with the condition that MCA tile be used on the roof. Ms. Rolando seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Mr. Newell, Mr. Parsley, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Torre. Nays: Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2014-011: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the Coral Gables Museum housed within the "Old Police and Fire Station" located at 285 Aragon Avenue, a local historic landmark and listed on the National Register of Historic Places, legally described as Lots 1 thru 4 and 42 thru 48 inc. and 20 ft. alley lying between, Block 34, Coral Gables Section "K," according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 33 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the installation of two gates and exterior lighting.

Ms. Spain stated that staff recommended a motion to approve the design proposal, conditioned upon the following:

- 1) Staff is to review the shop drawings for both gates prior to fabrication.
- 2) Staff is to review the conduit plan of the site lighting in order to minimize the amount of demolition at the plaza.
- 3) The LED lights appear to be over one foot in diameter. The chosen contractor is to verify the depth of the cornice prior to purchase and installation of fixtures and demonstrate to staff that the lights will fit and not be visible.
- 4) The LED lights at the tower, while able to change color, must not flash, chase, change colors in a pattern, etc., at any time.
- 5) The conduit from the junction box to the LED lights at the tower must not be visible or attached to the exterior of the historic building.

Mr. Salman, project architect, comprehensively reviewed the proposed project and scope of work. Board members engaged in discussion with Mr. Salman and staff to clarify various design elements.

Ms. Spain relayed the history of the White Way Light, donated by the late Sam Larue to the City of Coral Gables, which will be installed in the small courtyard as an outdoor exhibit.

Ms. Thomson made a motion to approve issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the Coral Gables Museum located at 285 Aragon Avenue with conditions of staff as stated and included in the written report. Ms. Pruitt seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Rolando, Mr. Newell, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

BOARD ITEMS / CITY COMMISSION / CITY PROJECTS UPDATE:

Ms. Spain reported that the TDR Zoning amendment was going forward on September 11, 2014 as a recommendation of the Historic Preservation Board.

ITEMS FROM THE SECRETARY:

Ms. Spain announced that Amanda Gonzalez, who was a part-time archivist in the past, is now the full-time City Archivist.

Regarding the ceramic historic landmark plaques, Ms. Spain reported no progress; however, she expressed confidence that it will be positively resolved as the artist's husband wants to honor his wife's work.

Regarding the rehabilitation of the MacFarlane properties, Ms. Spain reported that progress was ongoing. The case will be brought to the Board after several processes have been completed.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 21, 2014

Continued

ADJOURNMENT: There being no further business to be considered, the meeting adjourned at 6:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, reading "Dona M. Spain", followed by a horizontal line extending to the right.

Dona M. Spain  
Historic Preservation Officer