

City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting
Agenda Item I-5
July 10, 2018
City Commission Chambers
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL

City Commission

Mayor Raul Valdes-Fauli
Vice Mayor Frank Quesada
Commissioner Pat Keon
Commissioner Vince Lago
Commissioner Michael Mena

City Staff

City Manager, Cathy Swanson-Rivenbark
Assistant City Manager, Peter Iglesias
City Attorney, Miriam Ramos
City Clerk, Walter J. Foeman
Deputy City Clerk, Billy Urquia
Arts and Culture Specialist, Catherine Cathers

Public Speaker(s)

George Navarro
Sandra Cardona
Robert Hazard

Agenda Item I-5 [0:00:00 p.m.]

A Resolution approving the concept for a work of public art, by Michele Oka Doner, in conjunction with the Merrick Park Hotel project, at 4241 Aurora Street, in fulfillment of the Art in Public Places requirement for public art in private development. (unanimously recommended by the Arts Advisory Panel approval/denial vote: 6 to 0, and the Cultural Development Board approval/denial vote: 7 to 0)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And I-5, Michele Oka Doner.

City Attorney Ramos: I-5 is a resolution approving the concept for a work of public art, by Michele Oka Doner, in conjunction with the Merrick Park Hotel project, at 4241 Aurora Street, in fulfillment of the Art in Public Places requirement for public art in private development.

George Navarro: I'd like to just thank staff because staff has been fantastic throughout this process. I know a lot of developers consider whether to install art on their project and it's been actually a very nice experience, so I just wanted to say that.

Commissioner Mena: Thank you to Ms. Hancock for...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Commissioner Mena: Making time to come down. We appreciate.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much.

Commissioner Lago: Can I ask you a quick question? We have a list of artists...

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: That we provide certain developers that want a little bit of guidance.

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: Some -- are all these artists on that list or...

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: No.

Commissioner Lago: They've gone outside of the list?

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: Yeah. Sometimes, they'll come to us with an artist and the artist first goes through the prequalification process.

Commissioner Lago: Okay.

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: So, if they're not on the list, they go through that first with the Arts Advisory Panel.

Commissioner Lago: Perfect. Thank you.

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: I'm sorry. Did you read this one?

City Attorney Ramos: I read it.

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: Oh, sorry. Okay, so the last one for today is a development project by Michele Oka Doner, with the Merrick Park Hotel. And Sandra Cardona is going to present this one. Thank you.

Sandra Cardona: Hello, Mayor, Vice Mayor, Commissioner, City Attorney, panel. We're very excited to be presenting this project. It is important to us and we actually started the process by looking into who the preapproved artists were so that we took the due diligence that was done prior and tried to see if we can make a good fit with the selection. So, our interior designer for our hotel project in Merrick Park is AvroKO, and we've collaborated with them to select Michele Oka Doner, who is internationally renowned. She is originally from Miami, and she actually has done an incredible body of work where a lot of her process is rooted in the natural

world. And she's most famous for, actually, the Miami International Airport project, which I'm not sure if this is -- am I up on the screen yet, the actual...

Commissioner Keon: Keep going.

Ms. Cardona: No, that's not it. It should be the PowerPoint slide. Am I in control? Yeah, I'm going to -- is this back or forward?

Commissioner Keon: It needs to be Merrick Park.

Unidentified Speaker: It's a separate PowerPoint?

Ms. Cardona: It should be a separate...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: So, if CGTV can help us queue for the Merrick Park Hotel, if there's a PowerPoint of that art.

Ms. Cardona: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Do we have it?

Ms. Cardona: Perfect. So, she's famous for *A Walk on the Beach*. That is constructed at the Miami International Airport. We started working with her early on in just her initial concept for how to approach the public project with us. And if you see some of the samples of her work, or if you're familiar with her work, it's basically a wide spectrum of different projects using different materialities, and there's a lot of conceptual overlay with the natural elements. And so, for our project, we didn't have a lot of area within the property to actually locate a large, let's say, sculpture. And we thought and worked with her later on in the concept of creating a portal, an entryway into our built environment that the public would actually not only be able to see

from the outside, but actually walk through and experience. And so, early on, the idea that she came up with was to basically take the actual cellular structure and its geometry and create a geometric pattern that became integrated into the glazing element of our entire entryway. And so, it was really a unique and interesting approach. And we actually are quite excited through the process. Originally, it started off as a screened element made of bronze. And we went through a process back and forth where this is architecture and we wanted to make sure we weren't installing something that wasn't going to wear well over time. And also, it is a system that is integrated into the doorway. And so, it had to be able to comply with hurricane codes. And so, through that process, we actually took the screen and conceptually embedded it into the glazing system. So, this is a line elevation just showing how the geometric structure of -- I want to get this right -- the actual cellular structure of a tree is what is the geometry of the pattern. And so, this is a sample where the actual process took a golden metal metallic glazing and nailed it into the laminated art. And the result is quite beautiful. This is -- in this elevation here, you can see how this entire entryway is going to be made up of this glaze system, both fixed and within the door itself. These are just samples of the detail inspiration. This is her actual art concept board. Here is a site plan showing where we would have this opening, which would be almost central to the city -- to the block of our lot. And here is a rendering showing how the entire entryway would really become illuminated with this glazing artwork.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

Ms. Cardona: What we also did was we took the framing elements and we are actually making sure that it's customized to match the actual glazing bronzed elements and size. So, the entire entry will read as one piece.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, do I hear a motion?

Commissioner Mena: I just -- I have just a question.

Commissioner Lago: I have a few questions also.

Commissioner Mena: This is beautiful.

Commissioner Lago: Yeah.

Commissioner Mena: My question is -- so this is the doorway to the hotel?

Ms. Cardona: This is the portal way, the entire entryway to the main entrance.

Commissioner Mena: I guess my...

Ms. Cardona: Did I...

Commissioner Mena: Question is, is that a public place?

Commissioner Keon: It's a public building.

Ms. Cardona: We...

Commissioner Keon: It's a hotel.

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: I can answer that. That's okay. One of the requirements...

Commissioner Mena: Is that -- are we looking at...

Commissioner Lago: Right.

Commissioner Mena: More like plazas...

Commissioner Lago: Yeah. It's a...

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Commissioner Lago: Public building, but it's -- I don't think there's real -- if you look how deep the entrance is...

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Commissioner Lago: It's not easily visible from the street.

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Commissioner Lago: So, my -- I have a little bit of a concern with that. I think the work is beautiful. She's an exceptionally talented artist. I mean, she's represented by Marlborough Gallery in New York and throughout the world. I mean, I looked at her resume. I had never heard of her before, and I -- now that I see her work in the airport...

Commissioner Keon: Yeah.

Commissioner Lago: Now, it's like, hey...

Ms. Cardona: Sure.

Commissioner Lago: Every time I walk by and I'm like whoever did that is incredibly talented. My only concern is what -- exactly what Commissioner Mena alluded to. You can't see this from the street, so how are people going to be able to enjoy this, unless they're actually accessing the hotel to go to the restaurant or...

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Commissioner Lago: The bar, or actually staying there. So, it's a little bit of a concern of mine. When we talk about public art, I want to make sure it's public.

Ms. Cardona: So, the -- and that is something that we discussed also and with both the Arts Advisory Panel and the Cultural Development Board. And we did talk to them about how far in from the roadway it is and you have the exact footage there. But it is accessible from the street and viewable from the street, and as you're passing through and, again, maybe you can speak more to that. And...

Commissioner Mena: Is that the valet there?

Ms. Cardona: We do have the...

Commissioner Lago: Yeah, that's -- that was the valet.

Ms. Cardona: It's the front entryway.

Ms. Cardona: It's the main entryway to the hotel. I'm trying to access the file again.

Commissioner Keon: But you know, I think what makes it interesting sometimes is, you know, in wonderful cities, for this, particularly, as a pedestrian, it's how you come around a corner and you see something that, you know, you wouldn't otherwise see or you're walking -- I mean, if you're walking along Merrick Park or in that area of Merrick Park where there are so many things to see. It's that, you know, you walk by the front of a building and where there isn't the opportunity or the space to actually place a sculpture or to place a large art piece, you know,

when it is incorporated into the building like that, it's -- it is -- it's one of those things like, you know, you turn the corner and you see it and it makes you smile.

Commissioner Mena: It's beautiful.

Commissioner Keon: You know, it makes you smile.

Commissioner Mena: But it's...

Commissioner Keon: It's very viewable from the street...

Commissioner Mena: For me, it's a hotel feature.

Commissioner Keon: As a pedestrian. What?

Commissioner Mena: To me, it's a feature of the hotel and it's not a public piece.

Commissioner Keon: Well...

Vice Mayor Quesada: You know what this reminds me of? 396 Alhambra, the door...

Commissioner Lago: The door.

Vice Mayor Quesada: That they have in the front. Did they get public art credit for that? Was that -- does anyone know?

Commissioner Keon: I don't know.

Commissioner Lago: I think they did.

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: They did not go through the...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: It's a beautiful door, though.

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: They didn't go through the process for that.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And you can see it from the street.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Because I just think it's the most analogous situation.

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: They did it on their own.

Vice Mayor Quesada: But then...

Commissioner Keon: Yes.

Vice Mayor Quesada: At the same time...

Commissioner Keon: Yes.

Vice Mayor Quesada: But at the same time, we have buildings that we allow public art when it's on the façade.

Commissioner Keon: Yeah. The Codina building is -- the art -- it was -- you know, the plaster work and whatever.

Commissioner Lago: Naomi Fisher.

Commissioner Keon: And the work that was...

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yeah, exactly.

Commissioner Keon: On the façade of the building.

Commissioner Mena: Right. But this is sort of tucked -- my concern is that picture you showed me of what looks like a carport sort of. The other...

Commissioner Keon: Well, I think it's probably a protected...

Commissioner Mena: That.

Ms. Cardona: It's the view of the rendering. Of course, it's a cropped image.

Commissioner Keon: That's from the inside, though.

Ms. Cardona: When you look at the site plan -- and look at the evening rendering. It's basically a massive marquis that wraps the portico. It begins to announce that there is something grand, very old world. You can walk...

Commissioner Lago: If you look...

Ms. Cardona: You can see this...

Commissioner Lago: If you look at the...

Ms. Cardona: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: Marlborough website, which I just briefed over very quickly, she has some exceptional bronze sculptures of these figures that are beautiful that could go anywhere, you know, near the paseo. Could be a beautiful entrance feature where people could actually enjoy it. I think -- my opinion -- this is what I would ask you to do, if you could. You know, maybe my Commission disagrees, but I think that what we should do is maybe go back and take a look at what options we have. And I'd love to see if the artist could potentially give us some other ideas because I'm not a hundred percent sold...

Ms. Cardona: Well...

Commissioner Lago: On these...

Ms. Cardona: I'd like to speak...

Commissioner Lago: Features that become...

Ms. Cardona: To that.

Commissioner Lago: That become the -- I'm not a hundred percent -- and listen, I'm a big proponent of conceptual art. I think it's great. But I just -- no, no, but -- and I want to have this conversation back and forth.

Ms. Cardona: And I want -- because we -- this was -- we spent a lot of time early on asking some of those questions and we went back and forth initially to make sure that before we embarked on that direction was it something that would qualify. And we were told early on in the process that actually it would. And so, conceptually, Michele's idea was how the public interacts with that entry portal way. It's beyond just a doorway. It's a portal way, and it's bringing the public in and it's bringing the public out. Yes, I'm sorry.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: The gentleman that's with the hotel. I think that you've talked about this same issue for a long time. Why don't you give us your opinion and your...

Robert Hazard: Yeah. I just want to point out that when we initially conceived this project -- oh, I'm sorry. My name is Robert Hazard. I'm Senior Vice President of Development for Hersha Hospitality Trust, who is the developer of the project. We originally conceived this project with our partners at GGP from Merrick Park. The reason that this was important to GGP was the -- this side of Merrick Park wasn't getting any pedestrian traffic. And so, they wanted to have a facility built on this site that would activate this part of the neighborhood. And as part of a concept plan in there, this whole idea of creating this paseo that goes completely around the block and putting a, you know, dinner house restaurant followed by the entrance to the hotel, followed by the entrance to a bistro was going to activate that entire neighborhood and really create pedestrian traffic on the street that otherwise didn't have any pedestrian traffic. So, I think that the paseo is really that public thoroughway that you're looking for. And...

Commissioner Lago: No, not really.

Mr. Hazard: This is an...

Commissioner Lago: Not really.

Mr. Hazard: This is an element to that that...

Commissioner Lago: And let me just interject there one second because when you said paseo -- to me, a paseo is not a public thoroughway. It's an opportunity to get from one location to the other without having to go around an entire block. If I'm correct -- you can check the minutes, and I recommend that you check the minutes because I'm wrong sometimes. My wife would probably say I'm wrong a lot of times. But I told you that something that I thought was very important, since you were removing -- and it's your property rights because you're the owner of

the property -- since you're removing such a big piece of green space, why don't we -- at the corner or in the back -- and we could have a taller building. I don't have a problem giving you a taller building so you can make up that square footage -- leave a piece of green space where a beautiful sculpture could go, where people could sit and they could enjoy under a canopy of trees. You know, it doesn't have to be big, you know, 5,000, 6,000, 7,000 square feet. You have a big piece of property there. And if you told me that -- but this is what -- this is the conversation we had before. So, if you're talking about activating and, you know, real opportunities for people to congregate, no one's going to congregate in a paseo. I'll give you prime examples. Look at the Aragon parking garage, which cuts through. I don't see anybody congregating, except people smoking cigarettes when they're on their cigarette break. So, it's -- and that's a perfect example of a paseo that cuts through a piece of property to save that person time. Paseos are meant as a vehicle for a person to get from one side to another. They're not meant to be areas for congregation, especially since there's a real lack of light. It's not a place where people are going to use to sit down and relax. And I'm just giving you my opinion and I think...

Commissioner Mena: And I get...

Commissioner Lago: Your project is spectacular.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We're talking about the art here...

Mr. Hazard: I would agree with you if it was just for pedestrians...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Not...

Mr. Hazard: But there is...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We already approved the...

Mr. Hazard: There's seating there. There's an outdoor living room. There's a -- it's an arcade. It's not just...

Commissioner Lago: But the reason why I bring it up is because the reason you're in the position you're in right now and you don't have a location to put a piece of art is because you don't have any green space.

Unidentified Speaker: Right.

Commissioner Lago: And I brought that up to you and I made it a point at the last Commission meeting. It's perfectly fine. We voted on your project. I mean, it's perfectly fine and I think it's going to be a great addition to the City. But don't tell me that you don't have any green space now and, you know, that we got to approve now a doorway into a building because that's all we have. I gave you an option.

Ms. Cardona: To just clarify, we do have our entire second floor (INAUDIBLE) is (INAUDIBLE) space.

Commissioner Lago: But that -- wait, wait, wait. Now, we're getting into something else. Hold on.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, no. Let's not get into...

Commissioner Lago: Mayor...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I agree with you.

Commissioner Lago: Mayor, but let me...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We're talking about art.

Commissioner Lago: Mayor, I -- let me -- this is important. Because I think there's fundamentally -- there's fundamentally a disconnect here, and Mr. Trias is going to bring this up later. Your second floor is not accessible to people unless they're staying in the building or they're having dinner or drinks in the building. So, this idea in the city -- and I'm going to change it. I'm going to change it. The idea that second floor is public space is not -- it's not. So, when we have public art, public art -- and like your attorney will tell you, because your attorney's very well versed on this. I'm a public space guy. It's not that difficult. I'm willing to give you whatever square footage you're going to be missing out by pushing the building back a little bit -- this is before -- I'll give it to you on the second floor. I'll even give you more...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, but...

Commissioner Lago: For having the vision -- just let me finish, Mayor, one second, please. I'm asking you for this moment. I'll give you more space than what you miss out on the first floor. I'll give it to you on the top floor. And the reason why I tell you that is because then you don't have predicaments like you're in right now where you're basically telling me that art is an entrance feature, which, again, in conceptual art, art can be whatever you want it to be. It can be 175 candies thrown up against a wall.

Commissioner Keon: That's gorgeous.

Commissioner Lago: So...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah. I totally disagree with you in terms -- we approved the building as it was, and the -- they told us that it just didn't make any sense to have an eighth story in order to move the building back because that just didn't make any architectural sense. Let's concentrate

on the art. Is this art acceptable or is this art not acceptable within the building as it has been approved? If it is good art...

Commissioner Mena: But can I ask you...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And if it is...

Commissioner Lago: It's great art.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Visible from this -- okay, then let's vote on it.

Commissioner Mena: My -- yeah, but the issue -- again, I think it's beautiful. I think it's clearly art. I think it's a beautiful entrance to the hotel. My issue is, is it a public place because this is supposed to be...

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: I just want to comment on it...

Commissioner Mena: An art in public place project.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: Being set back because that -- they went, I believe, three times to the Art Advisory Board. And my concern with this piece was that it was the envelope of the building.

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: It was the envelope of the building, so it will have to meet the NOA and hurricane code. And one of the good parts about it being recessed is that it's a little protected as art. I mean, it's not...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Is it visible...

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: Vulnerable.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: From the street?

Ms. Cardona: Yes.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: It is visible from the street.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Very visible from the street or just...

Ms. Cardona: Very visible.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: And particularly...

Commissioner Mena: Do you have an image of that?

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: At night, they're going to have light behind it, I believe.

Commissioner Mena: Do you have any images of what -- the rendering or whatever, of what that looks like from the street?

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: I think they do, right?

Mr. Hazard: Just that's...

Ms. Cardona: This is to show you...

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: That's the interior.

Ms. Cardona: Up close. This is to show you...

Mr. Hazard: You should go back and forth.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: Show the night one.

Ms. Cardona: This is...

Commissioner Mena: But is that -- I want to just ask this again.

Commissioner Lago: Recessed.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: I understand.

Commissioner Mena: Is that a car -- is there like a carport there? Is that where...

Commissioner Lago: Yeah.

Commissioner Mena: Cars will valet?

Commissioner Lago: That's a porte-cochère.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yeah.

Ms. Cardona: It's not a -- the porte-cochère comes out over the side...

Commissioner Lago: So, it is a porte-cochère.

Commissioner Mena: Will there be cars parked in front of the door for valet...

Ms. Cardona: It's at...

Commissioner Mena: Purposes?

Ms. Cardona: There's no -- a few seconds here and there. It's not going to be a bottleneck.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: There might be. You're right.

Ms. Cardona: So, there is...

Commissioner Mena: It's a valet, though. There's going to be a valet there.

Ms. Cardona: It's a drop-off.

Commissioner Lago: So, it's a -- like I said, it's a porte-cochère.

Ms. Cardona: If you could...

Commissioner Lago: There's an overhang where cars come in and they drop people off or they pick people off. It's a valet.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, but it's visible from the street.

Commissioner Lago: So...

Commissioner Mena: Not if there's cars...

Ms. Cardona: It's visible from...

Commissioner Mena: Parked in front of it.

Ms. Cardona: The street.

Commissioner Lago: So, let me ask you a question on the corner -- on the corner -- on -- can you go back to the previous slide, if you'd be so kind? On the corner, all the way to the right, my right...

Commissioner Mena: Yeah. I'm -- this is the -- is this the rendering?

Commissioner Lago: Yeah. That's the rendering.

Ms. Cardona: That's a day rendering, yes. That's the building.

Commissioner Mena: That's...

Commissioner Lago: But you have a big bulb out...

Commissioner Mena: Really recessed.

Commissioner Lago: Yeah. You have a big bulb out. Could you -- I'm not saying to put it in the public right-of-way, but could you put it somewhere maybe in the corner of the property, where they will have more access and at least be more visual to people who are walking by?

Ms. Cardona: Are you saying if we can relocate the door system to one of the other...

Commissioner Lago: Not the door system.

Ms. Cardona: Corners?

Commissioner Lago: Not the door system.

Ms. Cardona: The portal way?

Commissioner Lago: Look at this exceptional artist -- this exceptional artist. Look at her other sculpture work that's available from her portfolio.

Ms. Cardona: Well, I -- just for -- if you allow me to go through...

Commissioner Lago: Of course.

Ms. Cardona: Some of her work. What she was inspired by -- if you look at the skylight that she integrated on the right, that was an example of a system where art was integrated within it and it impacted both, let's say the -- it impacted the space.

Commissioner Lago: Where is that skylight?

Commissioner Mena: In the -- when you walk through the terminal, I think, right?

Commissioner Lago: Is it?

Ms. Cardona: Miami International Center.

Commissioner Keon: Yeah.

Commissioner Mena: Yeah.

Ms. Cardona: It was hand-etched. Her artwork was integrated as part of the system. And she was very drawn to the concept of hotel, the concept of...

Commissioner Mena: But...

Ms. Cardona: People coming in and out, congregating...

Commissioner Mena: I'm all for that.

Ms. Cardona: Outside.

Commissioner Mena: But that's the problem.

Ms. Cardona: And welcoming...

Commissioner Mena: I want to make...

Ms. Cardona: Just the whole concept...

Commissioner Mena: I'm all for that. Again, I think it is art. I think it is interactive. I think it's a beautiful piece of art for this hotel. I just don't think it's in a public space. I think it's a beautiful feature for the hotel, a spectacular piece of art. But I'm looking at this rendering and now, when I think about there's going to be cars, guests checking in, luggage carts, whatever there is, I just don't see how anybody from public spaces can really appreciate that unless they're accessing the hotel. I mean, look at the size of that roof. It's really a covered space. That's my problem...

Ms. Cardona: But that space...

Commissioner Mena: With it. I'm not disputing that it's art...

Ms. Cardona: Sure.

Commissioner Mena: And that her...

Ms. Cardona: Sure.

Commissioner Mena: Vision of it being interactive is not a fair, artistic, you know, endeavor, but from our perspective and this being an art in public place, that's my concern about this.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yeah. We -- you know, I a hundred percent agree with Commissioner Mena. I love it. Man, I would love to see it as a part of the hotel, but that's a great benefit to you, but not really the public. I also have a little bit of a concern in giving the art bonus and credits and -- even when it's on a building, I feel like that's something that should be policed by the Board of Architects and ensuring that those designs that we love are incorporated in the public art is a piece of art that can be seen and used and enjoyed. And what I think about, it's on a park or it's in an area where people can congregate.

Commissioner Mena: But even on the façade of the building, I can understand because you can appreciate it from street level if you're walking by. That's my challenge with this doorway is -- and again, looking at this rendering, it's really pretty recessed and you're going to have a carport in front of it at a hotel, which we all know what valets and carports at hotels are like. They're busy, understandably, and hopefully, this one's very busy and this is a very successful hotel.

Commissioner Lago: And I would hate to see the -- this beautiful artwork be kind of glanced over because people think it's just an architectural feature and they wouldn't take a moment to say, okay, you know, where is the plaque? Who is this artist?

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: We have...

Ms. Cardona: Well, this is where...

Commissioner Lago: I know, but...

Ms. Cardona: Just to speak to that.

Commissioner Lago: But I think that when you see, like, for example, a freestanding sculpture of some sort or something that's protruding from a building, again, it's not my favorite.

Ms. Cardona: It's...

Commissioner Lago: It's not -- I'll give you an example. I'll give you an...

Ms. Cardona: It's interesting because we had this dialogue where -- you know, what is art. A sculpture; is it a doorway? This -- she saw this as imagine the forbidden gate. She saw it as a gateway and...

Commissioner Mena: It's absolutely art.

Commissioner Lago: Yeah.

Ms. Cardona: Even the plaque on the side that we're showing here, this would be iconic, let's say, to that area and people would go there to see it because they could see it from -- you can access it. It's not an interior doorway. And I know that we spent some time discussing it.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: We did.

Commissioner Lago: My final...

Ms. Cardona: A lot of time.

Commissioner Lago: My final point that I was...

Ms. Cardona: Sure.

Commissioner Lago: Trying to make was we have such limited opportunities to bring world-class art to the City and we have a Commission which is committed to that. We want to make sure that when people come to the City, they think about, okay, let's go see the art that has been purchased by the City or purveyed by developers who have built great buildings in the City. But I want to make sure that it's accessible to everyone and that it's clear and present and that it's actually public art. Not that somebody's going to walk by and say, you know, is that just, you know, a different type of material that was used on the exterior of a building of some sort of cladding that can be confused. I want something that's a little bit more out in the open, where people have accessibility to it.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright. Do I hear a motion?

Commissioner Mena: I just -- again, I can't really say this enough. I think it's...

Commissioner Keon: I think it's lovely.

Commissioner Mena: Beautiful. It's beautiful. I love it, but that's...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Do I hear a motion?

Commissioner Mena: Not the issue.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: I understand.

Commissioner Keon: You know, I would make the motion to approve it. I think part of art is that incorporation into the architecture of a building that makes the building itself a thing of beauty, which, you know, they -- so, go ahead, they don't want to do that; they'll buy a sculpture, stand it in the lobby or stand it on -- you know, by the front door and have, you know, plain wood and some brass or some plain glass and don't do anything.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And you have a precedent for that in the Codina building.

Commissioner Keon: Right.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: On Salzedo and the art is incorporated into the walls of the building.

Commissioner Keon: The building. I mean, I think it's -- I don't -- I mean, it may not be visible from the street in a car going by at 25 miles an hour, but...

Commissioner Mena: Where is it visible from?

Commissioner Keon: As you walk.

Unidentified Speaker: The sidewalk.

Commissioner Mena: As you walk where?

Commissioner Keon: As a pedestrian.

Ms. Russo: The sidewalk.

Commissioner Mena: As you walk into the carport of the hotel.

Ms. Russo: No, it's not...

Unidentified Speaker: It's not...

Ms. Russo: When you're walking down the entire -- excuse me. As you're walking down the sidewalk -- so, the hotel is facing Alterra, and as you're walking...

Commissioner Keon: Yeah.

Ms. Russo: Let's say you're leaving Nordstrom's the first space is slated to be a restaurant. But as you walk down, around the arcade that basically encompasses and goes around the entire building, you can see it from any angle as you're walking.

Commissioner Lago: How far is it recessed?

Ms. Russo: You'll be able to see it from the block...

Ms. Cardona: Twenty feet.

Ms. Russo: But it's (INAUDIBLE)

Unidentified Speaker 1: So, as you're walking down...

Unidentified Speaker: Because the arcade is there.

Ms. Russo: The sidewalk, you will see it. You don't have to be standing in front of the doorway to see it. You will be able to see it -- you know, say this is the doorway. As I start walking down the sidewalk or the arcade surrounding the hotel, the doorway is visible. In fact, that whole space outside is an outdoor space that was created to bring street presence and activity in the street, but will also benefit the art because people will be in the outdoor space before they even get to the entrance of the hotel.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You made a motion. Commissioner...

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yes, she made a motion. I'm going to second it, and I'm going to move to approve it. But just based on -- but I think we should revisit our -- I don't think that they should be prejudiced because, in the past, we have given credit for things like this. But I think we need to be clear in our Code of what sort of exposure...

Commissioner Lago: What is -- if you give me a minute. What is the cost of -- it's one percent, right, of the total construction cost?

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: And so...

Commissioner Lago: What I'd like to see is...

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: I think it's important that developers, when they hire the architect, also hire an artist. Because when the architect is working on a building, he needs -- he or she needs to be able to envision where the art's going to go if they know that there's an --

what has happened in the past is that they're so far along in the design of the building when they hire the architect, so then the -- I mean, the artist. And then -- so, the artist then has a limited areas to work with.

Commissioner Lago: Madam City Manager...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Sir...

Commissioner Lago: Mentioning...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: I'm looking at the...

Commissioner Lago: No, no, it's okay. No, no.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Art in Public Places ordinance.

Commissioner Lago: That's what I was going to go into. Can we have -- you know, going off what Vice Mayor Quesada said -- can we have a discussion with Dona Spain and her team and our Art in Public Places Board and have a discussion with them to see how we can maybe kind of take a look at whether -- so we can avoid having these, you know, issues in the future where art is not just recessed or in a lobby, like the Mayor mentioned that Codina building has art that's inside a lobby.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, no, no. It's in the wall.

Commissioner Keon: On the building.

Commissioner Lago: No, but it's also -- I know...

Unidentified Speaker: It's on the façade.

Commissioner Lago: I know, I know. It's not only in the façade, but it's also in the lobby, and they have terrazzo floors that are there and it's in their elevator also, along with paintings that are on the wall. If you're -- if you don't go into that building -- if you don't go into that building, you won't know that's there. But they also have...

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: That wasn't part of the art in public places.

Commissioner Mena: Right, only the outside part.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, the outside part.

Commissioner Lago: Oh, okay. Okay, so that's different.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. Let's -- a motion has been made and seconded, and I agree with you...

Commissioner Lago: Because we only have so many -- we only have so many opportunities where these...

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: I know.

Commissioner Lago: Large buildings are going up and we can really have some art there that...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Commissioner Lago: Can be visible for the future.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Can you call the roll?

Commissioner Lago: This is good for the future. This is a...

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: I think it's an important discussion to have.

Commissioner Lago: This is a very important discussion.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Can you call the roll, please?

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yes.

Commissioner Keon: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: No.

Commissioner Mena: No.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

(Vote: 3-2)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much.

Commissioner Lago: And do me a favor. I'd like to know also the -- I'd like to be educated on the process of when an artist comes or a developer comes and they say we're spending X amount of money, so -- if they had to put a wall -- a door there before, is this just laminating on that door or are we getting a credit for that?

Commissioner Mena: Yeah, I agree.

Commissioner Lago: How is that process coming?

Unidentified Speaker: Yes, they do...

Commissioner Lago: Because...

Unidentified Speaker: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: Before this Commission was here, I heard there was a few issues before where people were not given the right figures in regards to what they were spending on art. So, they were getting some significant reductions by...

Unidentified Speaker: There...

Commissioner Lago: Putting some art there that wasn't up to par.

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: On the closeout documents, they have to show the receipts for the expenses that they've spent towards the art, and also, in this particular case, when it is integrated then...

Commissioner Lago: But do we get copies of...

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: They do need to do...

Commissioner Lago: Do we get copies of receipts?

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: A credit -- they need a credit.

Commissioner Lago: Because most of these -- for example, most of these developers have to deal directly with a gallery. Like, for example, I'm pretty sure that this gentleman here is not

dealing with the artist directly. He has to deal with a gallery. So, reputable artists, they say, hey, I don't deal with this.

Unidentified Speaker: We're dealing directly with the artist.

Unidentified Speaker: Well...

Ms. Russo: And just so you know, the affidavit that is signed, Hersha...

Commissioner Lago: A lot of the artists that I've dealt with when I've said I'd like to, you know, deal with you on a one on one basis, they say no. You have to deal with my gallery.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: So, if I can -- so, we'll have a workshop. We'll set up a workshop with our cultural art -- the Arts Advisory Board and the Commission. But I will say, when the Art in Public Places guidelines were presented, an example that the Cultural Board used was the Chihuly ceiling in the lobby of the Norton Gallery. And so, yes, public would have to go in. And so, that's good for us to go over those guidelines because it's always important -- you have an art masterplan that is budgeted in the '19 budget. Good opportunity for you all to inject yourselves not only in the art masterplan, but in those Art in Public Places guidelines for a refresh.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I would like to go on because we have a -- have counsel here, but...

Commissioner Lago: Yeah, but I'd also like...

Commissioner Mena: I just...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I congratulate you on your initiative to have a workshop, but I have -- I think we have to be very, very careful that we don't substitute our very good taste for those of the artist or those of the...

Commissioner Mena: No.

Commissioner Lago: Well, that's not the case.

Commissioner Mena: That's not the case.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I'm very (INAUDIBLE)...

Commissioner Mena: That's not the point. That's not the point. I'm...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I think it is the case.

Commissioner Mena: I just want to say -- okay. My point is -- and I want to be really clear about this. I'm really disappointed in this. I really, really am because this is something that you could have done a beautiful doorway and the hotel could have done that as a feature on its own, and we could have also had an art in public place. And I feel like this is sort of an end around the public place portion of this. And it's disappointing because I think we can do better.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Commissioner Mena: I think you could have had a beautiful doorway, maybe by the same artist, paid for by the hotel to have as their doorway to the hotel.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

Commissioner Mena: For me, the public place part is what's missing from this, and it's disappointing.

Commissioner Lago: And if I may add one thing also.

Commissioner Mena: It's definitely art. I want to be clear about that. It's beautiful. I'm not disputing that. My issue is we're a governing body and our role in this is for it to be in a public place.

Commissioner Lago: You basically -- you basically hit the nail on the head. And I just -- and I want to be very clear, okay. And our dear ACM, who has an extensive knowledge not only of the City of Miami, but also, the City of Coral Gables, will tell you when somebody brings a permit application here to the City and it smells a little bit funny because the number that they're putting on it is a little bit fudged, what do we do? We say let me see your contracts. Let me see your contracts to make sure your numbers are correct.

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Commissioner Lago: I -- again, I don't know. I'm asking. I'm having an open conversation so that I can be educated on the process. So, if we're not doing things accordingly where I want -- we're not protecting the artist -- because this is not only about the issue of the artwork. It's the issue of protecting the artist. I want to make sure the artist is getting every penny for the art in public places, that we're protecting them, that contracts are being reviewed by the City because we're not talking about \$25,000. We're talking about millions of dollars' worth of art in public places monies.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: As opposed to the flower at Segovia...

Unidentified Speaker: And this is...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Flower at Segovia.

Commissioner Lago: I don't know.

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: I'd just like to say...

Commissioner Lago: I don't know.

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: Also that with...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: (INAUDIBLE)

Arts and Culture Specialist Cathers: Public arts -- with public art commissions as opposed to private acquisitions, the preference is to work directly with the artist, and that's what many public entities do. And so, that we do -- we are very invested in having as much of those funds and monies go to the artists and the artwork.

Commissioner Lago: But like Dona Spain will tell you -- because I had several conversations with her and multiple artists that we were having -- trying to lure here for other projects, and those artists said -- what did they say? No, deal with my gallery.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: Right.

Commissioner Lago: And I can give you those names. She knows what the names are. They did not want to deal with any entity, either public, private, developer; it doesn't matter. The point was that they have a strict protocol and they said that protocol is that you deal with my gallery. For example, the sunflower, whatever you want to call it, like the Mayor just mentioned right now that that was a million-dollar commission, again, I done know exactly, but I'm pretty

aware that her gallerist is not only in New York, which is also Marlborough Gallery, her gallerist is also here in Miami...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Commissioner Lago: Which is Fred Snitzer. So -- and they had a hand in that.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: Actually, we were -- apparently, they worked directly with her. One more thing. The Code requires the art to be approved by the City Commission prior to the pulling of a building permit. And as part of that workshop, I'd like to talk about the timing because I -- the sooner they get the artist on board, the better the art is and the better the building is. So...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright. Let's continue. Thank you very much.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.