

City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting
Agenda Items H-5
June 10, 2014
City Commission Chambers
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL

City Commission

Mayor Jim Cason

Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.

Commissioner Pat Keon

Commissioner Vince Lago

Commissioner Frank Quesada

City Staff

Interim City Manager, Carmen Olazabal

City Attorney, Craig E. Leen

City Clerk, Walter J. Foeman

Deputy City Clerk, Billy Urquia

Jessica Keller, Assistant Public Works Director

Public Speaker(s)

Javier Salman, Vice President of Stantec

Jonathan Oman, Coral Gables Resident

Nicolas Cabrera, Coral Gables Resident

Alexander Adams, Coral Gables Resident

Deborah Swain, Coral Gables Resident

Sue Kawalerski, Coral Gables Resident

Mary Jane Mark, Coral Gables Resident

Agenda Item H-5 [Start: 2:36:32 p.m.]

A Resolution authorizing the adoption of the City of Coral Gables Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan.

Mayor Cason: H-5.

Interim City Manager Olazabal: H-5 - A Resolution authorizing the adoption of the City of Coral Gables Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan. Here we have Javier Salman who is going to be presenting the bicycle master plan. Javier.

City Commission Meeting

June 10, 2014

Agenda Item H-5 – Resolution authorizing adoption of Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan

Mr. Salman: Thank you Madam Manager. Mr. Mayor, ladies and gentlemen of the Commission, it is indeed my distinct pleasure to be able to present to you that which you have in your packets which is the Pedestrian and Bicycle Master Plan that we have been working on for the last couple of months in its completion. First, a little bit of history as we go through it. This requirement for the creation of a master plan comes from a grant that we actually helped the City acquire and it required some matching funds for the implementation and so the first step was to develop a master plan network that would augment the existing community network of bicycle and pedestrian infrastructure. Now that we've actually decided that we are going to replace the trees as they pass and we are going to continue a legacy of shade, we are going to be able to also look at building in the rest of the bicycle and pedestrian master plan for the City. In our presentation to the Traffic Advisory Board the other day, I made a comment which I think bears repeating today. The City of Coral Gables is unique among the communities of Dade County, in that it is a true live-work City. You have a vibrant downtown, surrounded by equally vibrant community of homes, neighborhoods, and the ability to be able to transit that on a multi-modal basis, whether it's your car, whether it's on foot, or whether it's on a bicycle and link that to the surrounding infrastructure of Miami-Dade County Metrorail and the surrounding municipalities is going to be unique among the cities in Dade County, and so we are very proud to have been a part of this effort and before you today is the master plan, which encompasses the goals – and there you see where I was talking about the...and the growing regional bicycle culture. In the development of this master plan, we looked at first closing the gaps within the infrastructure that existed, as well to get more people to be able to ride safely within our community. The only information available to us were the surrounding master plans and development of plans by Miami-Dade County, as well as the surrounding municipalities, our own previous plans and the limitations thereof. We collected data and looked at data with regards to crash in both bicycle and pedestrian, and we saw a pattern that has to do primarily around our main arteries, and so those are the one that we were looking at first. At the same time we discovered a series of opportunities and I'm glad to report that we are here today to be able to talk about some of those opportunities in building and creating that network. Chief among them is the legacy that we have historic improvements, such as...trail and other – and the fact that we are a planned community that this is part of a City that was visioned in its totality from its CBD all the way down to the smallest little park in many ways, and so we have boulevards and avenues and rights-of-ways which will allow for the incorporation for a network in many cases with minimal impact. It doesn't mean no impact, but in some cases minimal impact and will require coordination with the state and other jurisdictions to be able to implement; and so that's going to be part of what's going to be the implementation plan that staff will come before you to do. Now we have a series of recommendations with regards to possible alternate routes for development of an east-west, north-south connectivity, but in the development of that we were aided by a series of community stakeholders and I'm glad to report that we've had very positive feedback from the stakeholders. In many cases they came in with their own plans, which we looked at and worked into what

became the final document before you today. I think Commissioner Quesada was with us at the presentation of the additional plan for comment and we received those comments and incorporated those comments into a document you have before you today. Now how do you identify routes? We looked at what are some of the key inter-connectivity issues that we as a unique community have. We have a vibrant CBD (Central Business District), we have a great community in the form of the University of Miami, and the transit between those two is important. We have already an inpath that follows along U.S.-1, which is a multi-motor path to get parallels are Metrorail. We have a wealth of existing lanes and avenues and right-of-ways that will allow us to incorporate this mater plan, and we also have schools and the Old Cutler trail historic bicycle path, which has actually been extended all the way down to Cutler Bay. So we obviously identify the areas of high transit. We have a vibrant trolley system; trolley ridership is anywhere from 1,500-2,000 people a day depending on the day. The Metrorail transit is like 5,500; and we have a series of ongoing traffic calming projects, so that the City is constantly looking at polishing its “apple”, making the City more and more beautiful. We’ve taken areas of common ground left over from intersections and we need to reclaim them or repopulate them with trees and we are constantly looking at developing this City as the garden City that it is. So before you are what are the main routes that were described in the actual master plan, and what we are asking for today is approval of that master plan so that we can then begin the implementation of them and set that prioritization by your directive at the next level; and with that I would be remiss if I did not mention Mr. Tony Garcia of Street Plans, who worked with me hand-in-hand, but could not be here today, and even though he only put his name on the back of this thing, I want you to know that we both worked very hard in developing and getting that which you have before you today, and he put us on the front. Yes I know, but if you have any questions give me a call. I was just teasing, he’s a great guy and an absolute authority that I respect with regards to the development of these kinds of mater plans and he does it all over the world. Any questions?

Commissioner Lago: Thank you sir.

Mayor Cason: Well we’ve got a lot of people who want to speak; maybe we can listen to them and then ask our questions. Jonathan Oman.

Mr. Oman: Hi, my name is Jonathan Oman, 714 Santander Avenue. I live and work in Coral Gables and I just wanted to say that I strongly support the master plan. I bike, my family bikes, I live in a City with great shade trees as we talked about, we have a great downtown, check, we have a great university, check, we have a great Youth Center, check, great transportation options, we are getting to that check, but we are not quite there and the way to get that to that destination is through the master plan by expanding the options for bicyclists throughout the City. The people that are moving into Coral Gables whether they be in condos or single family houses, they bike. They bike with their families, they bike to work, they are part of a different culture

where bicycling is part of the fabric of life, the millennials, it's a major form of recreation. So I ask you to support this resolution and move Coral Gables into the future so that we can compete with other cities that have great bike systems. Thank you.

Mayor Cason: Thank you. Nicole Gtasi – not here. Nick Cabrera.

Mr. Cabrera: Good afternoon members of the City Commission, for the record my name is Nicolas Rafael Cabrera, and I live on 1410 Cantoria Avenue. I currently serve as the Secretary to the Board of Bike Walk Coral Gables, so I am going to speak on behalf today. I have a letter which I will be reading to you. Bike Walk Coral Gables unanimously supports the Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan. We have worked with the City staff, Street Plans Collaborative, and Stantec in the development of the master plan. We feel that it is a comprehensive plan that will give residents as well as visitors a safe and practical way to travel to key destination points within the City Beautiful. The master plan is the first step toward enhancing the accessibility of the City with alternative modes of transportation. We encourage you to adopt the plan and promote its implementation as soon as possible. We look forward to continuing to work with the City on this important endeavor. Now as a resident, I have many friends that have grown up here in the City, as well as I have, and that feel as strongly about the master plan as I do. Our friends and I want to feel safe riding through the City and today unfortunately that's just not the case. Sadly, the few lanes that do exist are not contagious and the majority and the intersections with nowhere to go. So I speak to you as well as Bike Walk Coral Gables on behalf of the young community, young people in our community to please support the plan. I support it through my father, who at one time was the biggest proponent of bicycle safety in the City Beautiful all supports it. Thank you for giving me an opportunity to speak.

Mayor Cason: Thank you very much. Alex, a trifecta for you.

Mr. Adams: Busy day today.

[Laughter]

Mr. Adams: We've been waiting a long time to get here. The Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan, because we don't want to leave out the pedestrians. We hear a lot about the bicyclists, but the Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan, first of all I want to say, will protect the safety of Coral Gables residents. I don't know if all of you know, but the Miami general area has been in the top five for over the last five years for bicycle and pedestrian deaths in the nation and this is a fact that we don't want to be in the top five. This is one of those that you want to get out of that list; and so particularly I know Commissioner Quesada is our member to the MPO and I think we need to take the message that this has to change. We have to change something, we are doing something wrong when we are on this list year after year after year. So I'm glad to hear that there isn't one community within the Miami area we are taking this initiative seriously and taking this

stuff forward. The master plan, I would also like to say should be used for all incoming developments, assuming it's passed, and should be used in all public works projects and any remaining Renaissance projects. That it could be incorporated into. Unfortunately, it was not incorporated into some of the previous Renaissance projects, it's an opportunity missed, split milk, but we need to look forward and I think the greatest part is implementing this plan in the future; and the other part that I would like to bring up is, we need to look for all funding sources. So the Commission last year, I believe, allocated a certain amount just like the tree master plan has an allocation. We need to look to maybe have a matching fund in next year's budget that if we go after FDOT grants, or we go after other MPO grants and other things, we have some matching funds there, and we need to go after these other funding sources, the City of Miami, Palmetto Bay, they've gotten like a million dollars to implement their bicycle plans this year. We missed this year's process, we need to go after next year's and we need to get the plan implemented so that it's not like our current one, which is just on a shelf in another plan. Thank you.

Commissioner Keon: When is the funding cycle of the application cycle for that?

Mr. Adams: I believe they've just ended like a month or two ago, so we have to wait...

Commissioner Lago: Commissioner Keon if you have a chance and the other Commissioners and the Mayor, I implore you to sit down and meet with Mr. Adams. We've met how many times?- probably three times...

Mr. Adams: Probably three.

Commissioner Lago:...and we are going to be meeting at the end of this month because he has...

Commissioner Keon: Mr. Adams is my appointment to the Landscape Advisory Board.

Commissioner Lago: We were meeting/discussing in regards to grants and opportunities, forthcoming opportunities not only for the bike and pedestrian master plan, but in everything from City Hall to everything in regards to matching funds and grants and stuff like that.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: That's a conversation we should have at another date when we have some time.

Commissioner Lago: We are way, way, way behind other municipalities in regards to....

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Whether we should hire somebody or not. I can tell you the City has hired people before and not been successful and hired people that has been somewhat successful. You just have to get the right person to do it, but that's a conversation we should have.

Commissioner Keon: Maybe we can put that on the August agenda; can we put it as a discussion item?

Commissioner Lago: And I want you to know that I'm 110 percent behind you in regards to that. I think that the investment, having someone on the payroll or an outside consultant, whatever mechanism we use, it pays itself back...

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Yes, it sure does.

Commissioner Lago:...we are talking about this year, I think alone in reference to bicycle grants it was I think close to \$3 million that we missed out on, something like that, I think \$2.5 to \$3 million that we missed out on. Obviously, let's not cry over spilt milk, but moving forward I think we need to make that decision.

Mayor Cason: Is Mari Gallet here?- she left. Debbie Swain.

Ms. Swain: Good afternoon Mr. Mayor, Vice Mayor, Commissioners we are very excited to be here. I know that I've talked to some of the folks that are speaking today. I'm Deborah Swain, my address is 4015 University Drive, I'm a resident, I'm a commuter, and I'm also the Chair of the Citywide Traffic Advisory Board. First, I want to just make a statement on behalf of the Traffic Advisory Board and it's already in your materials that this plan did come in front of us and we did vote unanimously in support of the plan at the last Traffic Advisory Board meeting. Now on my own behalf as a resident, not only do I live here, but I'm also a road cyclist, so really the things that are taking place or recommended in the plan that affect me so much personally as a road cyclist, but I also am a commuter and as a commuter I try to make my way through and across downtown Coral Gables. I'll ride three or four times a week, some weeks I can't ride at all, it's hard to ride like this, so today in the rain I didn't, but this plan was exceptional that it took a look at the destinations that people have and the ways that they need to get there, and I work closely also with Tony Garcia, with Stantec, I got to hear them. I got to give my points and not every single one is in the master plan, but I'm not the expert they are. I could have certainly come up with some things and as I've talked to them I realize they weren't necessarily the best way to go forward. So just to wrap it up, I know it's been a long day. I urge you to look at funding, I know the City of Pinecrest, on their \$1.5 million or \$1.4 million bike lane plan. They got a \$1 million grant from the state to fund it, so those monies are out there and that's the one that the funding cycle we just missed, so that's an opportunity in the future. I also urge you to consider adding to the current budget. You have \$400,000, I believe set aside for bike improvements. I urge you to also look at considering spending that even a small amount will go a long way in getting some things done; and the other thing that I ask is that the consultant didn't have adequate funding to really do a good pedestrian plan and we have folks coming to the Traffic Advisory Board all the time to talk about pedestrian issues and so I've become

particularly sensitive to that, particularly also since I live on a street that doesn't have sidewalks, but I would like to see that perhaps there is some mechanism to allow somebody to take a look at the pedestrian side a little bit more deeply and that we can see a recommendation in the future on that, that goes a little bit more in depth, but again, to summarize I appreciate you all doing this, taking this endeavor and urge you to approval. I look forward to working with your staff on it. Thank you.

Mayor Cason: Thank you.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Cason: John Swain – pass. Mary Jane Mark and or Sue Kawalerski, whatever order you would like to go in.

Ms. Kawalerski: Hi everybody. If you don't mind, I do have some materials I do want to distribute so that you can follow along with me, if that's OK with you please. Thank you for allowing us this opportunity to talk about this plan today. We think it's very important. First of all my name is Susan Kawalerski and I live at 6830 Gratian Street, and just to give you some background about why this subject is very, very important to me. In addition to being a resident and I love to see how my tax dollars are spent and I hope they are spent wisely. I'm also a cyclist, I've been a cyclist for, I have to tell you decades and that's plural, decades. In addition to being a cyclist, I have two jobs, in retirement I have two jobs, we both are in the bicycle business. One of them, I am the cycling advocate for Mac Cycle and Fitness. I also work for Miami-Dade County Parks Department as the Bike 305 Coordinator, of which the City of Coral Gables is a member, a partner, partnering entity with Bike 305. I am a Board member of the Everglades Bicycle Club. I'm a certified ride leader for the Everglades Bicycle Club, and I'm also a Board member of Riviera Neighborhood Association, basically comprising about 300 homes south of U.S.-1. So with that said, I've got a lot of interest in what happens in our community regarding bike lanes in particular, and more specifically safety as it regards to building infrastructure for Bike facilities in Coral Gables. So I want to give you a little background first and what I'm going to take you through and what I've handed you out. The first thing I'm going to take you through is this Coral Gables Bicycle Pedestrian Plan pamphlet and the very first thing you see there is a cover sheet. It's a Mac Cycle Coral Gables Bike Plan cover sheet, which basically is the cover sheet for a plan that Mac Cycle and the community of cyclists, residents and other concerned parties got together in April of 2012, and Mayor Cason thank you very much, because in 2012 you encouraged both Mary Jane Mark, the owner of Mac Cycle and myself to form a committee to develop a series of bike lanes. Basically a plan for Coral Gables. So thank you, and that was in April of 2012, just to give you a little historical background. So in 2012 Mary Jane Mark and I developed a committee, a committee of residents, of concerned cyclists, and knowledgeable people about where bike lanes might best be suited. By the end of

2012, basically December 2012, what we call the Mac Cycle Coral Gables Bike Lane Committee came up with what we considered the master plan. Now we are not certified engineers by any means, but we definitely are cyclists and we definitely did the surveys need to form a good bike lane network. The very first thing in our objective was to take into consideration the fact that we only have \$400,000 budgeted for any kind of bike lanes in Coral Gables. Now there is a lot of talk about let's get more money, but we considered just if we don't get one more penny what to do with \$400,000. So we decided a number of things; we had to first look at safety, we had to look at connecting existing bicycle facilities, facilities meaning bike lanes in particular and are paid by trails. We wanted connectivity to as many of these things as possible, schools, parks, the existing facilities, the Youth Center, Coral Gables High School, the M-path, which is the paved bike multi-use trail underneath the Metrorail, and Metrorail as public transportation. We wanted to make sure there was connectivity between the north and south sides of Coral Gables, and of course we wanted it to then take advantage at Ingraham Park, the beautiful Ingraham Park that was developed with a bicycle pedestrian bridge to then be able to bridge off into the existing Old Cutler Trail and Commodore Trails. So what we came up with in what we call Phase I, our Phase I of our plan, we call the Riviera Route; the Riviera Route is simply put the Riviera Route. It encompasses connecting existing bike lanes on North Alhambra, the Segovia bike lanes, and you take Riviera all the way down and it dead-ends at Ingraham Park, and it doesn't really dead-end, it just extends into a further network. It's a simple plan developed by simple people that's the way I like to say it, and how did we develop this?- we actually did bicycle surveys, numbers of times we measured roads to make sure that the roads could accommodate bike lanes, and in Riviera in particular we found this was the, how should I say, the no-brainer route for a \$400,000 budget, and let me just take you through some other things. There is a large map that I believe you have in front of you right now; Commissioner Quesada is holding it up there. So what developed after that, after a series of meetings with you the Commissioners, the Mayor, the Vice Mayor, the consultants, number of community organizations, we attended the public meeting. We input into the public meeting, and then we got our hands on the plan that was submitted by Stantec and Street Plans and found that, first of all there was no such thing as a pure Riviera route and their phasing system. It was instead a discombobulated set of bike lanes, but there was no continuous Riviera route, there was no simple route. What we found in front of you is the fact that they had chosen is their primary routing system and in effect, I believe it was shown today. The number one route was Salzedo going through downtown, which we know is going to be reconstructed; University – at University and Bird Road there is a major gap and that's where you find the donut hole there. The big red donut hole on that map. There is a major gap connecting University to University. As you all know, there is a major disconnect there because of the canal situation. They take University down to basically Ponce, and then there is a jog back up to Riviera in order to cross over one of the safest venues over U.S.-1, and that's Riviera. We couldn't quite understand the reasoning behind that truthfully, we were told that it was because there are so many students that use University to go to the University of Miami that, that was the

most widely used route, and therefore that should be the first consideration for any kind of phasing of a route. Well, let me just explain through a picture here. This University gap that you see here, the next picture that you see, in order to make that happen, they want to make happen. They would have to do what the FDOT calls the five-point intersection, that intersection of Bird Road has 21, at least 21 directions of converging traffic, OK. So if the bike lane ends over here, what is a cyclist and his family going to do at that intersection?- there is no way to get the connecting part of the University route that they are suggesting. We find that this plan unfortunately is dangerous to cyclists. It puts cyclists at risk, if this was going to be built without proper infrastructure and we can tell you because we have talked to various members of different organizations that this would take a long time of planning, a lot of engineering, a lot of rerouting, traffic engineering, in particular, cutting through guard rails, cutting across traffic islands, major traffic configuration for this plan to work. So we were kind of aghast when we saw that this was the primary recommendation for Phase I routing, and we could not understand why a simple plan like Riviera was not even considered as a contiguous plan. I think all of you know because we have met with all of you, our concerns about this, again this does not address safety issues instead it creates really a bad situation for cyclists, and we wanted to make you aware of that and make the public aware of this. So what we find in this plan, we have issues with this plan. We have issues with this Commission adopting this plan as written. There are inconsistencies, there is lack of data to support the routing and we have some data that supports the Riviera route. What you will find in this path is a Strava heat map, it's a snap shot, it's a spring shot – Strava for those of you who don't know what Strava is, is probably the most widely used cyclist tool to route their progress as they cycle, to route their routes, to route their progress, and what this shows is that the Riviera route is one of the most heavily used routes in all of Coral Gables. If you look at University on here, it shows it in black, it doesn't even show up as a widely used route. So we do not understand why the consultant would even say that Riviera is that University is widely used when it doesn't even show up on the most popular cyclist going. Just an aside about Strava; Strava has not been contracted by the City of Orlando, by the State of Oregon to actually give them data so that they can plan bike lanes and bike routes in their communities and in their state, so right at the pike they are using this as their, how you say, master plan to actually develop their routing; and again here, we don't understand why on page 30 of the master plan it says, unfortunately this route, Riviera, is not currently used by cyclists and as such will be included in the second phase of implementation. This Strava map clearly shows that, that's in conflict to reality. OK. So, we have taken this plan to a number of entities including yourselves, and the Riviera Neighborhood Association, I did a presentation, and unanimously the Board voted that Riviera, specifically should be considered as a Phase I routing in any master plan. Number two, the Office of Mayor Miami-Dade County Commissioner Xavier Suarez, who endorsed the consultant's plan in general when they were specifically told what was in the plan came out quote, in favor of the Mac Cycle Committee version of the plan implementation for the Riviera route as first phase of any master bicycle plan for the City of Coral Gables and would

like this stated on the record, which I'm doing now. Just for the record, the committee members are also in this packet. These are the committee members that we would like to acknowledge for the hard work that they contributed toward developing the Riviera route, specifically and the master plan in general, and they are not included in the consultant's plan. We would like them acknowledged please in any plan that goes forward. So what are we looking for from the Commission to do today? First of all, I believe when you adopt something, if you agree with something, otherwise you won't adopt it, if you adopt this plan as whole we are against that, you are against that action. What we are asking for that is if you chose to adopt this plan that you adopt it with amendments and the amendments are per the Mac Cycle Bike Lane Committee, per Xavier Suarez, per the Riviera Neighborhood Association, that you adopt the consultant's plan to include the Riviera route as depicted in the presentation materials as a Phase I implementation route so that we can be assured that the only \$400,000 that we have available to build anything in Coral Gables will be wisely spent on a safe first phase in Coral Gables. We would also ask that you set up a review process involving residents and cycling interests before determining further route phasing and/or implementation of any bike lanes or bike facilities, and that is if you adopt the consultant's plan because we find inconsistencies with it. Number three, we ask that you plan, budget, and implement bike lanes specifically and/or protected bike lanes as primary bicycle facilities throughout Coral Gables, except when an unusual circumstance necessitates a lower standard bike facility such as a sharrowed road; and four, we ask that you stripe all bike lanes with bikotory rumble strips to protect cyclists from distracted drivers, which has become an increasing problem particularly here in Miami-Dade County. With that said, thank you for your consideration and thank you for your time.

Mayor Cason: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: I have one question for you Sue. The Riviera route, I don't know if you said it or not, is there any enlargement of the pavement anywhere?- I thought you said no initially when I met with you, is there any...?

Ms. Kawalerski: Yes – and my answer is no to my knowledge, and I will tell you that I went out and bought a little Home Depot, one of those bike range things and drivers were thinking I was crazy because I was measuring as much as Riviera as possible by myself, and what the consultant would term a pinch-point, which means it's a narrow part of any straight-of-way, is 24 feet wide. Now Jessica Keller with staff says its 23 feet wide, so its 23 or 24 foot wide. It occurs at Riviera and University specifically, so you have the ball fields on one side, you have the library on the other side. Now there is no such thing as a legal bike lane width, it is a highly recommended and suggested and best practice to have a 4-foot wide bike lane on either side of the street, but that doesn't mean you can't have a 3-foot wide lane, or 2 ½ foot wide lane. Something that is clearly designated bike lane however, which means in the case that we are suggesting with rumble striping. So in answer to your question, do we have to take swale for

bike lanes?- no, in our estimation, in my measuring – no. The consultant’s plan, I think, also mentions that Riviera is perfect for bike lanes, OK, so to my knowledge – no.

Interim City Manager Olazabal: There has been some changes that have been made to the Bike Master Plan since we’ve spoken about it, and I guess the consultant and Jessica Keller can walk us through some of those changes, but one of them is that it doesn’t specify Phase I and Phase 2, and part of the reason for that is that they haven’t been fully designed or we don’t completely know the areas where we need to go to the swale or what the interlocal agencies calls maybe require to any of the two routes. So this is not an implementation, we are not trying to – this is not an implementation strategy. This is just defining the route and it doesn’t specify a preference at this point. As to whether the lanes are wide enough on Riviera, maybe Javier or Jessica....

Ms. Kawalerski: May I make one comment to that? I am basing my information, my presentation off of the submitted plan. I know that staff has been working on some changes, but I have not seen that final plan, if that has been resubmitted. I’m only working off the plan that was submitted per the contract, per the interlocal agreement; and regarding phasing, by inference, the way that the plan is set up, unless you have totally rearranged the plan. By inference the fact that Salzedo, University, Riviera, is addressed first, not only in the text of the plan, but also in the implementation pages on page 92 and 93, the inference is that, that is a preferred first phase route. In this plan there is no contiguous one phase of any kind for just Riviera and the consultant’s plan there is Riviera and some of the phases. There is Riviera, parts of Riviera and other phases, but there is no one straight shot, no-brainer Riviera route represented in this plan.

Mayor Cason: Let me ask you. In general, a part from the implementation and the phasing, and if there were money available do you have any disagreements with what’s in the plan?

Ms. Kawalerski: Like I said, and I can point out some areas that would be safety nightmares for cyclists no matter what you do. Look, you don’t want to build bicycle lanes on busy roads; you find alternate roads that are what you want. Bird Road is a nightmare, let alone that intersection that FDOT calls the five-point intersection, you do not want to place a 10 year old on a bicycle at that intersection trying to traverse Bird Road, I mean that’s insane. So let me say this in answer to your question. There are some concerns that we have for safety issues, Commissioner Suarez has concerns after we explained to his staff about safety issues, we should be thinking about safety of the residents, number one. So regarding the rest of the plan, there are issues which is why we said we have to have a review panel in order to implement anything else other than Riviera, we believe, and that’s what we are proposing. Because you know it looks nice and washy until you get into the – the devil is in the details and if you can start understanding and dissecting what’s in the plan there are some areas that we have some major safety concerns about.

Mayor Cason: OK. What is the reason that we need to approve this plan?- is it to get grants?- is it part of our requirements because we got the \$40,000 to do the study, we have to bless it; and if we bless it do we bless everything in it?- or do we – this is a plan that we will implement and that's a second stage, how we go about that?

Interim City Manager Olazabal: I think what you are blessing is that those other routes that have been studied. This is the plan as to implementation of it, that we'll have to discuss once we have a design for it. The routes haven't been designed, so we have to check that all the widths are there, that we get all the approvals with the appropriate agencies. So this is not let's put a shovel in the ground plan, this is just kind of setting where are the connectivity's what we do.

Mayor Cason: I have a concern on one part of the safety. I can't see bicycles going down Miracle Mile, I would never support that, that's in their bikes with pedestrians. We don't know how we are going to redesign that, but I can imagine people coming out of a restaurant after a couple of martinis trying to get to their car and getting hit by a bike coming down a bike path that's supposed to be they wouldn't expect a bike. So that's the only part of it that I – and the safety, I'm not a bicyclist, but I was worried about. I would like to see money to do the whole thing eventually, the question is how much would it cost?- and I'll ask Javier if you have something, how much of this can we do with what we have right now?- and can we eventually do it all?

Mr. Salman: Ideally – and as I presented to the Traffic Advisory Board, the adoption of this plan is to establish the commitment to developing a network of bicycle and pedestrian connectivity, but that entails not just the identified routes of which even – listen, the City is only so big, OK, and you have to go east-west and north-south, and there are only so many contiguous north-south roads and so many contiguous east-west that you can string together, so one plan versus another plan. They are all going to fall into a series of similarities. Now one of the reasons that we were requested not to do the prioritization, say OK, take the \$400,000 let's do this one first, well because that's really your purview, so we had to give you the options. Now likewise, in the development of what would be an eventual long term cohesive plan it's a culture like. We will have to establish and work with the police to establish enforcement of rules of the road both for the pedestrians and the bicyclists and the motorists, so we establish that level of respect that right now sometimes they don't get on both sides of the equation I want you to know. Likewise there are a series of sever inter-connectivity problems. One of which was very rightfully identified, which is the intersection of University, likewise that of Granada trying to cross Bird Road. We have really a unique opportunity on University because of an intersection there to do a crossing at that point because you already have a light there. So it would be a matter of timing, you have to work through DOT. We pulled that out because that's sort of outside of the low hanging fruit group. We agree that the Riviera section is probably one of the low hanging fruit pieces. We don't disagree at all, at all, the only problem is when we cross U.S.-1, there is going to be state

mandated and federally mandated requirements that we are going to have to meet. Again, we are looking at inter-connectivity.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Which are what?- which are what?- federally...?

Mr. Salman: Well U.S.-1 is a federally funded road, so you've got FDOT to deal with, Florida Department of Transportation, which represents the Feds.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: But once you get across there...

Mr. Salman: But once you get across you are home free, OK, but you've also got to cross Ponce. There are a series of improvements that are going to have to happen there for that inter-connectivity to work, and when we create roadways and sections the easiest ones are the ones that connect pieces you already have and those are the ones we identified as probably the ones we should get first, because when you create one of these you also create a bit of an attractive nuisance, because if you create a bikeway that dead-ends on something, well then you sort of buy the liability that comes with those crossings, so all of those issues need to be brought to bear in your decision as to which ones you want to implement first. We don't disagree at all with the Mac Cycle report necessarily. We object to some of her criticism just because we are professionals and we did do a full bicycle handlebar survey of the entire City looking at each of the roads and measured the route, and we...the areas where we had the pinch points and I believe that our possible of alternate routes that we proposed are extremely viable, including that of Riviera.

Mayor Cason: To do all of this, including the difficult crossings is it \$800,000?

Commissioner Quesada: \$2.3 million.

Mayor Cason: \$2.3 million.

Mr. Salman: Bingo.

Mayor Cason: \$2.3 million – and how much money do we think is out there that we can get realistically, if we adopt this, we are all in favor of this sort of thing.

Mr. Salman: Now the reason that we want to approve this is because we have a plan, it's so much easier to go to a government agency can you give us money because we want to implement this plan, which is why I think it's important that we have this issue brought before you because we have something that we can...

Commissioner Lago: If we would have had this vote in place three months ago, we could have gone after those, about \$3 million worth of grants, which Pinecrest got a slice; City of Miami got a slice.

Mayor Cason: That's recurring money that we...

Mr. Salman: Yes, it is.

Commissioner Quesada: We need something in place.

Commissioner Lago: You need two things, you need two things; you need this resolution in place and you need the mechanics to get you these grants that we currently do not have.

Mr. Salman: You already have the mechanics of the Traffic Advisory Board to help you with the selection of implementation of which projects you want to do first, because that's what that Board...

Commissioner Keon: We need someone to actually apply for the grant; you need somebody on City staff that is in charge of applying for grants.

Mayor Cason: We want to apply for grants, we'd like to fund the whole thing, I think, monies out there.

City Attorney Leen: I just want to make one comment because you mentioned attractive nuisance and I want to say two things. First, in my view this is a plan that's being adopted by the City and I believe it would fall within our sovereign function and be protected by sovereign immunity, just like when you decide where to put sidewalks or you decide where to put guard rails or things like that, it's important it be done as a plan though, and one thing I noticed in the plan was that it does include the bike route around the Granada Golf Course...

Commissioner Quesada: That's something I had on my list to bring up.

City Attorney Leen:...and I just wanted – one finding I would like you to add, if the Commission is willing, and I'm sorry it's not in there in advance, I would have put it in there if I'd thought of it. One finding I would like the Commission to add is the Commission finding that having bike lanes increases safety, which I do think is a finding that is self-evident, but is useful to include something like that when you are adopting a plan. Because one of the things that will happen is that this comes up eventually and someone makes the claim, Oh why did you put the bike lane there?- it led me into an area where I shouldn't have been. The argument would be look, this was part of a plan, we were doing it to increase safety, ultimately it's a sovereign function and you can't sue the sovereign for that sort of activity, only if we don't maintain the lane correctly. As to the area around the golf course, I've given an opinion in which I'm working on a more elaborate one. My office has already given an opinion, but I believe that's part of our sovereign function. Yes, there are always risks, someone could sue us and perhaps the court will not recognize our sovereign immunity and we would appeal it, but you know there are ways to address that risk through insurance, through our sovereign immunity caps, things like that, but is useful if there is

a finding that this increases safety. That's one of your purposes in doing this, both facilitating recreation and increasing safety.

Commissioner Quesada: Got it. I can jump in here. If I could ask Jessica Keller to come up. I've tried to be very involved with this item – if you guys could share – and I've met with both of you, and I've met with both of you, I've met with the different groups, I've heard all different thoughts and really just a few different thoughts. One item that came up that didn't make it into the written plan that I would like to either amend or keep it as a consideration is the fact of one of the LEED requirements is installing showers in new commercial buildings to make it easier if you are riding to work as Debbie Swain pointed out. You may ride to work and be sweaty, you need to be able to take a shower and stow your bike somewhere and be able to change so you can be productive at work and not smell in your meetings.

Mr. Salman: That's in there.

Commissioner Quesada: It's in there as for points going toward the LEED certification, but...

Mr. Salman: As a general recommendation.

Commissioner Quesada:...yes, general recommendation. The point is I think it's important for us to keep in mind because most of the commercial buildings that we have, actually all of the commercial buildings have restrooms on the first floor, all this is adding is make sure each male restroom has one shower, and a female restroom has one shower in addition to the stalls and the sinks they have there and that's commonplace and that really is going toward bike lanes. How many people realize that to pedestrian connectivity, that's number one. Number two is, remember we have a resident that told us they will give us \$200,000...

Mayor Cason: \$250,000.

Commissioner Quesada:...\$250,000 if we put in some sort of path around the Granada Golf Course. I don't remember seeing that in the plan for a path or recommendation, is that something that we should put in there or amend?

Interim City Manager Olazabal: Probably looking at as a pedestrian running path more than a bike path.

Commissioner Quesada: How about one lane like they do in Europe, like in Stockholm, one lane pedestrian, one lane bike?

Ms. Keller: I can tell you. I'm Jessica Keller from I'm now Public Works, Assistant Public Works Director, and I will be implementing this plan, and I come from the City of Baltimore where I implemented the bicycle master plan there, and one of types of facilities that I personally

designed was a shared use facility where you had biking and walking on the same path. So that's something that's very common in other places, and I think will work well there.

Commissioner Quesada: OK. Well it's something to keep in mind for you guys so it's on the minutes of this meeting to be incorporated into the plan. I think this makes sense. Route implementation: I had called a meeting with who I consider my bike trust of all the individuals that really have reached out to me in the past and we had a meeting, and I thought it was a very productive meeting and what I got from it is that first of all, thank you very so much for being involved, because all of you being involved whether you are 100 percent happy with the plan or not has gotten the plan where it is, and I'm really thankful for that, you guys help to make the City a better place. With the Riviera route as well as the first phase, which was taken out of where it's not in the plan. Everyone wants the same routes, if we win lottery we had all the money in the world I don't think they'll be any issues, because we can implement everything all at once. The biggest thing that stood out for me and Sue pointed it out on this sheet, this really jumps out at you, and if you've ever been at that intersection, I mean even in a car it's a pain in the butt. If you are not exactly the right lane you get pushed off the wrong direction, there is always some other vehicle that is always going, is a little confused and it could be a dangerous situation very quickly; and I remember we walked through it with my one-on-one meeting with that group and I felt more comfortable with it, and correct me if I'm wrong, from that meeting that we had really the conversation was they wanted to address this point because it is such a dangerous intersection. That's why the recommendation initially was for this to be the first phase, and I'm talking specifically related to Bird-Granada-University intersection, am I correct in that?- am I recalling that correctly?

Mr. Salman: That was part of our first phase, correct.

Commissioner Quesada: But then the rationale was because there is...

Mr. Salman: Because there is bicycle traffic through it, quite a bit.

Commissioner Lago: Because it needs to be addressed.

Mr. Salman: And because it needs to be addressed and is one of the major choke points. Whether we take bicycle traffic up Granada or University or Riviera, we are going to have to cross Bird at some point. Riviera might be the most indicated easily crossed section of Bird, but so far to the east that it doesn't address a good portion of the City to the west or one of the biggest users which is the University of Miami, which is why we sort of looked at points and traffic between points to allow that kind of movement to happen. We don't object to any particular route, we just identified that in our initial report which we then something we revised in our submittal to the County compliance with this grant to remove that as a priority, because it was something that we really needed to discuss, first of all from a staff point of view to elevate the knowledge basis to

what the implications are to do one or the other. We weren't hired to come up with the solution; we came up with what we thought were the most viable and best routes to promote the whole inter-connectivity. The next phase which is to evaluate each route as to their cost and then their implementation. We came up with some very conceptual cost, but they are by no means the final cost. Until we get the actual engineering done or somebody does the engineering, you really won't have the quantities to be able to do that; and if you use the FDOT standard rates, they design by miles, OK, so that they know its 80 cents a foot-mile, OK?- but you take that for the distances we have and you come up with like \$1,200, and you can't do anything in regards to paving enhancement for the kind of funds. So we coach our numbers in that so that we look at that with a grain of salt, and say hey, these numbers need to be carefully looked at in the development of that actual implementation plan.

Commissioner Quesada: Now this Strava map, this Strava heat map that I'm looking at that Sue Kawalerski showed to us. I looked them up quickly and it seems that it's a smart phone application that's used by cyclists and pedestrians. I assume not everyone has a Strava app. Do you know when this snapshot was taken?- was it on a Friday?- was it on a Saturday?- oh it is, OK.

Ms. Kawalerski: [Inaudible – off mic]...but it is widely used, it is widely used among cyclists, the only app out there.

Commissioner Quesada: Is this Strava heat map, I guess it's not consistent with the handlebar survey that you guys did?

Mr. Salman: I'm not going to say it's inconsistent, what I'm going to say is that I don't know what the sample pool that led to that map is.

Commissioner Quesada: OK.

Mr. Salman: I can tell you what our observations were, but in regards to hard data as to movement of people through a non-existent network, I can't tell you. What you may be looking at is what is viable given the infrastructure you have today, which is probably more likely, not necessarily the need for interconnectivity.

Commissioner Keon: Well you can look into that, you should be able to find that information when you go to their website.

Mr. Salman: You'll find out how many samples led to that map.

Commissioner Keon: How many samples and how they arrived at that.

Commissioner Quesada: I cut you off; you were going to say something.

Ms. Keller: What I was going to say is regardless of how this does get implemented, we already started the discussion to address that intersection at Bird Road, because we know that it is an issue for pedestrians and bicyclists now. So we already started that dialog and based on initial conversations, I think that we will make good progress in making that better.

Commissioner Quesada: What are your thoughts on rumble strips as they mentioned here?

Ms. Keller: It's not rumble strips, it's a textured paint and I don't have direct experience with that, but based on some conversation, I had I think it is a great thing to deal with distracted drivers.

Commissioner Quesada: Should we amend the plan for the areas to include this rumble paint?

Ms. Keller: Actually, I'm looking into it and I think that it will be something that we should implement here.

Commissioner Quesada: OK – and one more thing I want to mention. I had reached out to Chairman Sosa at Miami-Dade County to get additional funds. She had reached out to me and said that if we can incorporate bike lanes on, is it Campo Sano?- on Campo Sano that she would help out with additional funds from Miami-Dade County to help us with our plan, and it's in there, Campo Sano is included, so I reminded her of that recently to see if we can get on the list to get some additional funds to try to implement more.

Mr. Keller: We are also actively researching all the grant opportunities. I have experience obtaining grants for this type of construction, so we are moving forward with that, and it's not just infrastructure, but its programming and education as well.

Commissioner Lago: Another thing too, Jessica you are going to speak to Chairwoman Sosa. I'm going to speak with Commissioner Suarez this evening and mention the issue. He has already helped us out with close to \$600,000 for the MacFarlane Homestead District, so I'll ask him this is a really big need for the City, so maybe he can come through with a few dollars. Go to the well again, why not right? – and just one final thing on my point, I think what we need to do here today, I think we need to vote this resolution in, obviously the six routes, the whole Commission is behind this – really set forth a plan of attack for the next in regards to getting this grant money and really implementing six routes and making sure that we get this taken care of. I have full confidence with your expertise and your knowledge and experience that I think that we can achieve what the plan says. I know that we are caught up between Phase I, Riviera, back and forth, I understand that, but I think we need to look beyond that, look at the overall scale and the overall scale is safety for the bike riders and the pedestrians in our City.

Mayor Cason: And we'll try to find a way to do all of it. Alright – so...

Commissioner Keon: Can I ask one question?

Mayor Cason: Yes.

Commissioner Keon: With regard to the intersection at Granada and Bird with University where all that comes in, I know that you have said that it does need to be redone for safety reasons, who would bear the cost for that?

Mr. Salman: The City would have to.

Commissioner Keon: The City would have to?

Mr. Salman: Yes. It depends on how we couch it to the state; Bird Road is a state road. In work that we've done with other municipalities where you have a state road, it's sort of going off the subject here, but certainly their approval and their participation and absolution is going to be required.

Commissioner Keon: That's part of the only concern I would raise in moving forward with the implementation of that plan is, I'd rather see the bike lanes put in and a connectivity established before we start spending this kind of money on these intersection improvements or I'd like to know the cost associated with those intersection improvements with the limited funds we have. You know limited resources you want to try and do as much as you can, so I hate to see us use them for intersection improvements if we can do that maybe at a later date and actually provide the connectivity we need. Because even if you went on Riviera, if you followed up Riviera you can cut across Blue and go over to the University of Miami, so you still would hit UM. It would affect you going west, I agree with you on that. It does affect you going west, but I'm really concerned about this intersection because there is really not a place kind of in the center here to rest either. There is no place that breaks that median on Bird Road with all of the different turn lanes being – they alternate the turn lanes and whatever, so it's not just like you have east and west traffic. You have all kinds of turn lanes there also that are signalized too, so it's a tough intersection and then have no place in the center such a wide place to stop or whatever. I have a lot of concerns for that. That needs to be done before you could do this route. So is the Riviera route included in the master plan now?

Mr. Salman: Yes.

Commissioner Keon: OK. So you will then look at them and you will decide and you will come back with a proposal for the implementation, is that right?

Ms. Keller: Commissioner, I have taken a look at all of the recommendations and we are weighing all the alternatives and we are going to come forward with a plan for basic

implementation and preliminarily we want to connect the downtown, it will be inclusive of Riviera. I think it will all end up being a hybrid to address all of your concerns that I share.

Commissioner Keon: OK. I do trust your judgment.

Commissioner Lago: I have something that we were talking about before. Commissioner, I think that in the next year once we vote this in today, with the staff that we have we are going to be able to chase those dollars and like Frank just told me, we are \$1.9 million away from getting to the \$2.3 million, so I think we can really make a difference. Ms. Swain wanted to say one last thing because she was calling my attention.

Ms. Swain: Just real quickly again. My commute route takes me across that intersection. I live just south of Bird Road on University Drive. When I commute I go on Granada until I can cut off Granada and I go through the back roads once I get across Bird Road, but to cross Bird Road there is from University going north there is a light. I wait for the light and I go straight across, I can go pass the median and across the street and the only obstruction I have is a guardrail across there, but I do have a light to cross, and then I go on Bird Road until I get to Granada. There are crosswalks on the north side of Bird Road getting across Granada and across University. So I have many times gone just on Bird Road as well.

Commissioner Keon: I was at that light last week when there was a gentleman riding and ended that same thing.

Ms. Swain: And coming back the same thing, you have to wait for the light and then cross. It's not the prettiest intersection, but there are crosswalks and traffic lights there.

Mayor Cason: OK. Do you have a motion?

Commissioner Quesada: So moved. Hold on another speaker. Are there other speaker cards?

Mayor Cason: No. Go ahead.

Ms. Mark: My name is Mary Jane Mark; I live at 9380 Gallardo Street. My family and I ride bicycles in Coral Gables. My family has always been involved in bicycling advocacy, founding member of Green Mobility, City of Miami Bicycle Action Committee. I own a business where I interact with thousands of cyclists yearly. I hear their concerns about safe places to ride all the time. I've attended best practices seminars to learn how they do things in other parts of the country and other parts of the world. A master plan implies that a bike route is a safe place to ride. When examining this master plan I saw some areas that were red flags to me. If you insert a cyclist who might not be a good cyclist in an intersection such as Bird and University and there is another one, University and Pisano, which hasn't come up it can be a dangerous situation. Commuter cyclists and road cyclists can usually manage themselves. A lot of people that ride in

Coral Gables are families with children. They don't attend these meetings. They are not really well represented. They rely on their elected officials to look out for their best interests. The routes that we have been discussing some of them are not family friendly, and I think the Riviera route really should be considered almost as shovel-ready. Trees don't have to be removed except maybe one or two and people could be riding from North Gables to the South Gables to parks to schools to the University of Miami on the inpass to downtown if they want to commute by Metrorail, and also to the Commodore Trail and the Old Cutler Trail. So I just want to be certain that that route is seriously considered. We were working under constraints of \$400,000, we didn't realize that people were going to find other money, but as a first phase if something could be done for the community. I would hope that you would consider the Riviera route. Thank you.

Commissioner Keon: Thank you.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Cason: Alight, we had a motion by Commissioner Quesada, second?

City Attorney Leen: Is it OK if I add the finding about safety?

Commissioner Quesada: And part of my motion is what the City Attorney is about to say.

City Attorney Leen: Thank you. I'm going to add a finding that this is intended to promote safety and does promote safety.

Commissioner Lago: Second the motion.

Mayor Cason: Alright – Commissioner Lago seconds it.

City Clerk

Commissioner Lago: Yes

Commissioner Quesada: Yes

Commissioner Keon: Yes

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Yes

Mayor Cason: Yes

(Vote: 5-0)

Commissioner Quesada: Can we get an estimate?- can we direct the City Manager or Jessica if you can communicate this to the City Manager to get an estimate on the cost per doing a pedestrian bike lane around the Granada Golf Course?

Mayor Cason: I think they are looking at that.

Commissioner Quesada: Are they looking at that already? I wasn't sure if they were. OK. Just so it's clear we are all in agreement with that. Thank you.

[End: 3:43:34 p.m.]