

City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting
Agenda Item H-3
April 8, 2008
City Commission Chambers
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL

City Commission

Mayor Slesnick Donald D. Slesnick, II
Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Commissioner Maria Anderson
Commissioner Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr.
Commissioner Wayne "Chip" Withers

City Staff

City Manager, David Brown
City Attorney, Elizabeth Hernandez
City Clerk, Walter J. Foeman
City Clerk Staff, Billy Urquia
Assistant City Manager, Dona Lubin

Public Speaker(s)

Charles Girtman, Coral Gables Resident
Paul Marcus, Coral Gables Resident
Ray Airan, Coral Gables Resident
Dar Airan, Coral Gables Resident
Mary Anderson, Coral Gables Resident
Robert Fine, Coral Gables Resident
Luis Revuelta, Coral Gables Resident

H-3 [Start: 11:14:24 a.m.]

City Commission discussion on the reports from Board of Architects and Planning and Zoning Board on metal roofs.

Mayor Slesnick: H-3

City Manager Brown: Yes, Mr. Mayor, the City Commission asked a few meetings ago that we take the 90 day pilot study on metal roofs, and take that to the Board of Architects, and to the Planning and Zoning Board for their comments. Today we are prepared to bring you a report on those reports on both from the Board of Architects and Planning and Zoning Board on metal roofs, Mr. Riel.

Mr. Riel: Good morning. The Manager is handing down for you updated comments we received since you all received the packet on Thursday. As the Manager indicated, on January of 2008 we came before the Commission to give you a progress report on the previous ninety (90) day program that was implemented in the South end of the City. The Commission asked us to go the

Planning and Zoning Board and the Board of Architect to solicit further input on a program whether it be in a specific geographic area, citywide, etc. We went to the Planning Board on March 12th, and the Board recommended the following, and I refer you to the City Commission memo. It's a summary of their recommendation. Allowance of a ninety (90) day pilot program in the north area of the City east and/or north of U.S.-1/South Dixie Highway. Indefinitely/permanently in the south area of the City east and/or south of U.S.-1. Subject to all provisions and requirements as previously required for the previous program. In terms of the colors, no changes, no changes in architectural styles, no changes at all in terms of what were the 90 day under the previous 90 day provisions. The vote was 4-2; two of the Board members that did not support the motion, they had concerns about allowing the in southern portion of the City metal roofs on a permanent basis. We went to the Board of Architects, when I say "we", Carlos Mindreau and I, we went on two occasions; we presented them the updated progress report, which you have, you should have with you, if not we have extras available. What we've done since the January meeting, we went back and re-photographed a lot of these, and some of the roofs have been completed since that time as well. So this is an updated report in terms of the photography. Back to the Board of Architects – we had some very, very good discussion, all the Board members participated. Basically the board recommended unanimous approval to allow metal roofs on single family residence citywide, and I would have you refer to Exhibit "C" in the packet because they got very, very detailed in terms of memorializing their comments, and rather than summarize those, I think they are very succinct and very to the point. They did suggest changes be made to the provisions which as a part of the discussion, I didn't get that from the Board when we went on two occasions the summary or the indication I got from the Board was they like if its to be put in the City, Citywide they wanted more time, they wanted two weeks to look at the projects, or the metal roofs, and they wanted more information in terms of they wanted photographs of the surrounding homes across the street to try to get a better idea of the context, that's pretty much an application something we can do in terms of an application requirement. As I did indicate the Planning and Zoning Board were 4-2, and the unanimous Board of Architects. That basically concludes my presentation. At the January meeting the Commission asked for a video, we have a very short seven minute video that I'd like to show to you. The video has been on the web page since probably for a month or so ago, but I'd like to have them go ahead and roll that video.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Hold on before you do that, I just want to clarify one thing; it was a 4-2 vote, and the two dissenters said they did not want to make it permanent in the south end, but they wanted to have a pilot program in the north side, or what was exactly their sentiment?

Mr. Riel: Basically ninety days in the north, and ninety days in the south again, that would have....

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Ninety days in the north and ninety days in the south, right.

Mr. Riel: Yes.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: That's what they said.

Mayor Slesnick: That was the four people?

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: No, that was the two, the two; the other people wanted to make it permanent in the south and extend a pilot program to the north, right?

Mr. Riel: Correct. You can go ahead and roll the video.

[VIDEO PRESENTATION]

Mayor Slesnick: This is a report that we asked the Manager to bring back on metal roofs, we are not taking action today, this is not a.....if in fact we take action this will brought back as a specific agenda item with some proposal from one of the Commissioners or all of the Commissioners, and then we'll take action. We do have people signed up to talk, as is our custom we are going to allow it, but for those of you who we have heard from before, and who will be back again, I can tell you that today is shorter is better, but we'll start down this list, and I'd like to say that as continuation of last time, and our conversation about procedure, is that we do have public hearings and we have other items on the agenda that are not public hearings, this is not a public hearing, but again in an effort, because I know that people have been here this morning to see and hear this and say something about it, we are going to allow that. Start with Mr. Charles Girtman, 744 Tibidabo, and Mr. Paul Marcus will be next, and I know that he has an appointment so he'll be second.

Mr. Girtman: Before I start my remarks, I'd like to ask the City Attorney for a definition of a lobbyist. I've seen people who are not registered speaking here that have financial interest in these metal roofs in the past, I don't know who is speaking today. I have no financial interest in them, I have nothing but citizen's interest, would you please tell us what is a lobbyist?

City Attorney Hernandez: Mr. Mayor may I?

Mayor Slesnick: Sure.

City Attorney Hernandez: A lobbyist is a person who has been retained to represent the interest of another.

Mr. Girtman: Thank you.

Mayor Slesnick: Well, let me ask you further, if somebody is a paid employee of a metal roof company, and they are...

City Attorney Hernandez: This is a legislative matter, they are here on behalf of their company, you know, if they are paid by an applicant in order to represent a position then they have to register as a lobbyist in the Office of the City Clerk, and fill out the appropriate paperwork.

Mayor Slesnick: Thank you.

Mr. Girtman: I'll start now...metal roofs: Metal roofs are better in hurricanes, I passed you some pictures out there, one of them showed last month a metal roof blowing away in not even in

hurricane force wind. Two, get a Florida Power and Light rebate; yes you did, anybody who has a light colored roof no matter what it's made out of, if you call Florida Power and Light they will tell you how to get a rebate, call their business office. Three, metal roofs give you lower insurance rates; anybody who's had a roof put on since 2002 and the new standards of construction went into effect, call your insurance company, tell them that they will tell you how to get a reduction in your wind-storm insurance. Four, all metal roofs are the same; there is a whole heck of a lot of difference between a copper roof and a steel-plated roof. A copper roof, a good copper roof can last a hundred years, which springs metal roofs. All of this has been....run around vacant lots and cut our feet on tin cans; tin cans are not made out of tin, it's made out of steel. The positives of metal roofs: the big positive of metal roofs is it's cheaper to put on; you can put it on top of a roof that has been originally designed for shingles because of the lighter tresses. If you are building new construction you can use lighter tresses so it's cheaper in the short run to put on. I gave you a list here of forty people; five of the forty are in favor; the other thirty-five are against. I've never ever seen an item come before this Commission that has such lop-sided against it versus the few that are for it, and yet the dog won't die. Let me give you a couple of comments, Laura R., we all know Laura R, she was just here; I have a rental in the City and I want a metal roof, she is a positive; Mrs. Hall, this is a positive, we live in Pinecrest where we replaced a shingle roof with a metal roof, new owners tore the house down, negative comments, you know these people, everybody you know these people; Jack and Barbara, we have a North Carolina home, metal roofs look fine there, but not on San ____; one of the ladies who have spoken here three times identified her here on the thing, but I'm not going to do it on the microphone, this is to here neighbor – question: would you like to see more metal roofs?- answer: no, one is enough. I attended the Planning and Zoning Board meeting; I've been on Boards here for over ten years; I've been chairman of Boards; I've fought about money on the five year plan; I sat on the Code Enforcement Board when there is money, a lot of it done everyday. I've never seen a Commissioner come and ask sweaty the Board's opinion, I'm going to quote Commissioner Anderson, it's on your....

Commissioner Anderson: Excuse me a second, before you start, I did contact you to see if I could speak on this legislative matter, is that correct?

City Attorney Hernandez: Any citizen of the City of Coral Gables....

Mr. Girtman: Did I say it was wrong? I said I've never seen it done.

Commissioner Anderson: Well, other Commissioners have spoken at different times; let's just keep to the facts. I understand...

Mr. Girtman: I'm going to quote you right....

Commissioner Anderson: Absolutely, it's your prerogative.

Mr. Girtman: Because of gravity, I've got to just partially quote you, if you think it's out of context....

Mayor Slesnick: Mr. Girtman, just let's lower the tone here, I don't....don't yell at Ms. Anderson.

Mr. Girtman: I apologize Commissioner; the facts don't bear out that we're a truly Mediterranean City; I cite the Coral Gables Community Profile Handbook. This is the first fully planned community incorporating residential and commercial areas inspired by the architectural style of the Mediterranean. Also, we have a Mediterranean ordinance, I believe we are a Mediterranean City, maybe you don't think so. Two, he, and I start in mid sentence for purpose of gravity that's on page 121, 122, 123 and 124 of the Planning and Zoning minutes; he, Mr. Merrick, talks about architectural harmony and if a material, whether it be metal roofs, we didn't even have metal roofs of this kind when Merrick was alive, answers: I've never seen Merrick written about metal roofs anywhere. Commissioner Anderson – and again, I start in the middle of the sentence, if you like a full quote give me the time. I'm probably in the minority, yes that is the minority, it's at least twenty one against these; democracy is majority rule; I won't tell you what minority rule is, you can put your own definition to it; and thirdly, her most ringing endorsement of metal roofs – metal roofs are not an abomination.

Commissioner Anderson: ...taken out of context.

Mr. Girtman: Like I say, ten years I served on Boards, I appeared upon this Commission many times, when we were doing the five year plan for the Police and they wanted every toy possible in the book, and I stood up as long as I could, Barker was my sponsor then, put me on that Board, I'd go over his house and said, Jim, look at this, look at this, what are they doing, dah, dah, dah; he listened to everything I said sometimes as emotional as I am right now, he put his hand on my shoulder and said, Charlie, I put you on that Board, I'm not going to tell you what to do. The vote was 2-4 in favor of what they passed on to you, 2-4. We all know those of us who have followed court procedures in Dade County that ten years ago there was a chase involving the Metro-Dade Motion Picture Board, and one of the appointed Board members took a differing position from the person, the Commissioner who had appointed, the Commissioner who had appointed him jerked him....God I almost slipped there....jerked him off the Board. He sued the Commission; the Circuit Court held that you don't have a right to sit on that Board, if the Commissioner doesn't want you on there whatever standards in our case it goes before the whole Commission, they can take you off. So you do put people on there and the people on there if they want to stay on there, they may or may not, but I think it's an undue influence when you ask for the Board to go a certain way, and then come back and recommend to the Commission, it seems you were getting into circular logic here. I've about wrapped up here, I'll tell you this.

Mayor Slesnick: Time is running out.

Mr. Girtman: I only need fifteen seconds. I was watching one of my favorite movies the other night, the Great Escape, World War II prison camp with Steve McQueen. I looked at it and then I stopped it, I "Tivo'd" it, backed it up, all the prison huts there, all the prison huts were in nice yellow color with a beautiful metal roof on it. Gentlemen, I think you very much.

Mayor Slesnick: Thank you.

Commissioner Cabrera: Mr. Mayor, you know, it's interesting you talked about the historic values in comments dated April 8th, Arva Moore Parks spent a few paragraphs of some historical perspective with regards to metal roofs and I'm not sure whether....I mean, obviously she was doing this as a citizen, and not in an official capacity, but I think we all recognize her for her historical expertise, and I think her message to us was to be very careful and to please think this very thoroughly before we move forward with it. I don't know if you all saw it, but I thought it was a very good commentary that Mrs. Parks wrote on behalf of, I guess she was representing herself.

Mayor Slesnick: Thank you. We have, as I said before, Mr. Paul Marcus, 476 Ravino.

Mr. Marcus: When by the way will you be voting on this?

Mayor Slesnick: If in fact its brought back people will be notified that we are having a public hearing on it, so in other words, if in fact a Commissioner or several Commissioners wish to bring it back on the agenda, we would bring it back get their request, and it would be publicized as a public hearing.

Mr. Marcus: Approximately what time period would that take?

Mayor Slesnick: Could be next meeting, it could be the meeting after that.

Mr. Marcus: OK.

Commissioner Cabrera: You raise a real interesting question. If and when it comes back, can we have this as a time certain item because it seems to have so much interest?

City Manager Brown: Absolutely Commissioner.

Mr. Marcus: I've been waiting...

Commissioner Cabrera: I know you have.

Mr. Marcus: No, no, I don't mean here.

Commissioner Cabrera: Oh, you've been waiting awhile.

Mr. Marcus: When the ninety day period was before, I had several cancer surgeries and wasn't thinking of roofing, and need a new roof and I've been waiting to see if this will pass. When my roofer brought it forward and tried to get it done, I have letters from all of my neighbors who all agreed that I should go ahead with a metal roof because they are happier, because if you put up a cement roof you put up a barrel tile roof, and something comes loose, it will hit their house and it will cause damage to their house. I mean, in my area which is Hammock Oaks in south Gables, we do not have the Mediterranean look as the north Gables. So I understand to differentiate between the north and the south. My home is a ranch style home in Hammock Oaks, and it's about thirty years old, and so the – actually the barrel roofing tiles don't fit that architecture very

well. The flattened cement roofs actually are more expensive today because all the cement is going to China. So, we went a step further, we went looking for the best that we can get, and the best that we could get that would fit in it is an aluminum roof because we are by the water so even though its steel, aluminum is not going to rust and should last virtually forever. I don't need a copper roof that's going to last a hundred years, but an aluminum roof would certainly last. There's several things as I've said, its safety, it's the beauty of it, it's safety for the neighbors, but the other thing is the "greening" of it. In "Time" – I was reading in "Time" Magazine last week where they were talking about the necessity of roofs to be reflective, and that's not just with paint, but when you have a metal roof its reflective, and it is really a "green" roof. So we can do a lot if we have all of our roofs in the country "green", we would do a lot, and to get the barrel roofs today we are dealing with clay, we are dealing with a much lighter clay than we used to be doing and they are darker. They cost us more to air condition, which takes more electricity, and they have no "greening" effect whatsoever. So I think we could do a heck of a lot better for our City and the beauty, and the south area where we don't have the Spanish Mediterranean look; I think we have it far more safer, we have less roof repairs, I mean every report I've read said its twenty-five to thirty-five percent stronger in a hurricane. Is it perfect?- no, but if its put on correctly it is far, far better in a hurricane, you have less repairs, longer life span, far more "greener" to the economy, and I for one would like very much to be able to put my roof on before the hurricane season, otherwise I'm forced to put on a flat roof that I do not wish to do. You showed in the video that they had several homes, and several of the homes they showed we're in Hammock Oaks, and in Hammock Oaks it does fit our architectural style just fine. So, I think when you are looking at it from the City as far as architectural and the visual point, you have to look at the fact that it's the south area, especially in Hammock Oaks, it's a totally different architectural south, than it is in north Gables. Thank you very much for your time and consideration, thank you so much.

Mayor Slesnick: Thank you for your thoughtful comments, we appreciate that.

Mr. Marcus: Does the Commission want copies of letters from people...

Mayor Slesnick: You can submit them to the City Clerk that would be fine. These are people from Hammock Oaks?

Mr. Marcus:yes, what I did was just get people around the house....[inaudible-off mile]...

Mayor Slesnick: Thank you. Mr. Ray Airan of 1252 Obispo.

Mr. Airan: Good morning everybody. I'm coming to the Commission for the second time; my comments are to say that I need to replace my roof and you all know the benefits of the metal roof versus clay or the other kind, and sometime somebody asked me if my house value is historic or not, I have a couple of pictures to show you what it was, and what it is today. At this time my house has not historic contributing factor that I know of, and these pictures will show you what it is today, and somebody else asked if I have done all this work without permit, and I can assure you everything is done with the permit, and with the help and guidance from the City staff on the third floor. Thank you.

Mayor Slesnick: Mr. Dar Airan of 1429 Alegriano Avenue, is that correct?

Mr. Arian: Good morning Mr. Mayor, Commissioners; my name is Dar Airan, and as the Mayor just mentioned I appear before you as owner of the property at 1429 Alegriano. My comments basically are – first of all let me tell you I'm not looking to replace my roof; my roof is fine, I don't need to do that, but I do believe and once my brother Ray, told me about this item coming up today, and about the pilot project, my initial thought was that the pilot project should be for the whole City; it should be Citywide, there's no reason to differentiate between the north Gables and south Gables, I think property owners in north Gables like I am should have the same opportunity and option for the metal roofs. So as long as the Board of architects and Planning and Zoning Board overall favor this idea, I believe it's something good. My as a lay man, even though originally I'm an engineer, now I'm not practicing engineering for many years now, but my lay-man-type question was first of all does it work, or is it safe both for the owner and the homes around it. Is it aesthetically pleasing and finally how much does it cost?- and it seems to me for all of those four questions the answer would be resoundingly in favor of metal roofs, and I believe that Dade County material testing has tested these and is meeting the South Florida Building Code requirements. So for all of those reasons I believe it is economically wise, and aesthetically appropriate, structurally safe, and does the job in keeping the house fortified. So for single family homes Citywide I would be in favor of metal roofs. Thank you for your attention.

Mayor Slesnick: Thank you. Good to see you Dar, you haven't been here in years.

Mr. Airan: Maybe first time in more than ten years that I am appearing before you, even though I used to be more active in the past.

Mayor Slesnick: Good to have you back. Mary Anderson, 1526 Trevino.

Ms. Anderson: Good morning.

Mayor Slesnick: Good morning.

Ms. Anderson: Mary Anderson, I reside at 1526 Trevino Avenue, and respectfully I understand the application of metal roofs in Coral Gables is an important consideration for all the officials of our City. I personally appreciate and respect the unique historical and architectural aspects of our City and community as well. As our other friends and neighbors who have responded and supported the use of metal roofs throughout Coral Gables, they feel that once they have signed a petition or sent comments that they are permanently recorded and added to the ongoing campaign. Please understand that all we are requesting is the opportunity to protect our homes, families, and community with the highest quality Miami-Dade County approved "green" building materials currently available. This is a more expensive roofing system than cement or clay tiles, and can afford additional energy and environmental possibilities for home owners such as capturing water to a cistern for lawn irrigation or household use. Out of fairness to our busy citizens and our community have worked so diligently in the campaign for metal roofs, for metal roof approval in the City of Coral Gables, we respectfully request that all comments over the entire period of the campaign, which I guess is approximately two years, whether written or delivered at the multiple Commission meetings and review Boards be recorded and posted on the

City website. This will reflect the full scope of the support from our residents, design professionals, environmentalists, and historic preservationists. I attended the Planning and Zoning meeting in March and I know that they were supplied comments from homeowners. I was curious if all the comments over the last two years or just those brief comments when the website was actually established in March. That's one question, and then one other thing....

Mayor Slesnick: We have all the comments and they are posted in parts of our agendas.

Ms. Anderson: But the Planning and Zoning Board during that meeting, they were referring to comments from homeowners, and I was just curious were they the comments, letters, and petitions over the last two years, or only the comments that had come in from when the metal roof comment website was established in February of 2008?

Mayor Slesnick: Mr. Riel, you could just tell us.

Ms. Anderson: I think it's important that...

Mayor Slesnick: I've been here for the two years, and....

Ms. Anderson: No, I understand that.

Mayor Slesnick: ...but I was going to say, as far as I know we could distinguish all the comments in a couple pages as to the number of people who have commented, there have not been that many. We have had lots of comments from the same people, repetitious.

Ms. Anderson: I understand, people sign the petition, people are busy, you all know how many people come out to these meetings.

Mayor Slesnick: See, like Mr. Girtman stood up....Mr. Girtman came up earlier with forty signed of petition, that doesn't....to me, I mean, that was nice that he got those, but I depend more on thoughtful comments like you have made to us before, but we could publish all the comments that have been given to us, and the same names would reappear four, five, six times, I mean, the amount of comments we've gotten from the number of people have been minimal.

Ms. Anderson: I guess just recently they were posted and people could see that, they could see what their neighbors and their friends were saying about it.

Mr. Riel: All the comments have been posted on the web since the day this issue was....the Planning Department posted every document that came before this Commission....

Mayor Slesnick: OK, so there....

Ms. Anderson: You find that under the metal roof comments or....

Mr. Riel: Go to the meeting, we actually have a separate site of metal roofs, separate e-mail, the whole...

Mayor Slesnick: Before Ms. Anderson leaves here, would you have it outlined as to how she can tap into that.

Mr. Riel: I can send her the links.

Ms. Anderson: I'll look again, because I looked under metal roof comments and what I saw was just from February to today.

Mayor Slesnick: OK, and we want to make sure that what Mr. Riel said is true, so if you and he cannot find his comments let us know.

Ms. Anderson: I just think it's important, I don't know, do you think it's important that over the last period of two years that everything be available there for all of us to preview?

Mayor Slesnick: Oh absolutely.

Ms. Anderson: OK.

Mayor Slesnick: It's important to us, and it should be important to you.

Ms. Anderson: No, it is, that's why I'm here today. Thank you.

Mayor Slesnick: Thank you, and it is important. A new face Mr. Robert Fine (laughter) 360 Solano Prado. Welcome back Robert.

Mr. Fine: Thank you Commissioners, Robert Fine, 360 Solano Prado...

Mayor Slesnick: We saw your house, right?

Mr. Fine: What's that?

Mayor Slesnick: Did we see your house on that.

Mr. Fine: You did not see my house.

Mayor Slesnick: We did not...Did you not give us permission to film your house?

Mr. Fine: I got approval but I had some issues with my house, I have to change my plans and in fact so I know we are vested in, I'm hoping you will reinstate, nothing like a one inch quarter pipe with a hole in it for a couple days. Anyways...

Mayor Slesnick: Excuse me, but that is a shame, I mean.

Mr. Fine: Hopefully we can resolve that.

Mayor Slesnick: OK. You've worked very hard.

Mr. Fine: I've worked very hard, and hopefully I'll keep working hard but not for much longer. I'd like to touch on briefly on three different items this morning, I'll get in, get out, regarding this issue. First is the process we've been through, second is the south area, and then the north. We are here today as a discussion item, but there are people here who had an expectation of something different. When this matter went to the Planning and Zoning Board it had the appropriate comments from the Development Review officials, its actions transmitted as an ordinance going forward. The Planning and Zoning Board approved it as a proposed ordinance and until the day of notice came out most people dealing with this was not aware this would not be a public hearing at First Reading Ordinance today. The Planning and Zoning Board in your package you've got the record you can see the proposed ordinance there. Its my understanding that after the Planning and Zoning Board at some point along the way, the Manager's office decided to put this on as a discussion item, I respectfully submit that that is not consistent with what your Zoning Code says for the process and what's gone on. At the end of the day you will ultimately make your decisions, but there are a lot of people following us and working this process, you also have the Planning and Zoning Board who thought they were acting on a proposed ordinance to send to you, and they put in a lot of time, and a lot of effort, and I think its not fair to them as well. That's the issue on the process, by the way there is a bigger going forward that when certain things go in the process for staff to derail that process, you know, when its not appropriate really takes things away from one issue to getting to you, and this all started with you, and running that process. The south: the pilot program went through, in my opinion it was a success. As you are aware a large percentage of the area south already can have metal roofs as-of-right that's because of them being annexed from Miami-Dade County, but they are no longer Miami-Dade County, they are as much a part of Coral Gables as everything else, you are the Commissioners for them, their taxes, my taxes all go to the same place, and its all the same City, and when you get to that south area, and it was mentioned earlier and staff has actually commented on it there is a difference, and I don't think there is anything that indicates that metal roofs with the appropriate oversight should not be allowed. We have issues of hurricane resistance, energy efficiency, other green characteristics warrant moving this along without delay, especially since before you know it, it would be having a new hurricane season upon us. In a comment to a response to our first speaker, two responses; one is metal roofs that are being put on in South Florida are not what you see in pictures, or not what you see in Texas and Georgia, they are metal roofs that have to be prior approval, designed to meet the wind requirements of a high velocity hurricane zone, standards in the Florida Building Code, they are much more expensive than those roofs in the pictures, in fact they are generally speaking more expensive than putting on tile roofs. The second response is as far as the discussion as people who support or not support, I just want to remind you that when I came to you with my house, I had sixty six (66) letters in support of metal roofs back then in and of itself, and with...[inaudible]....Finally, the north: the benefits of metal roofs don't change when we cross U.S.-1. The architecture might change, but the benefits of the roofs don't, and I think when you are looking at something that the way our country, our world is going with the benefits of "green" materials, of energy, again, certainly that of hurricane resistance, if it is an item that can, and I'm not saying you can, but if it can exist peacefully and work in the north part, it's something the north should have. That said the trick becomes, how do you find out?- I think they've been a lot of thoughtful people, very talented people from staff to members of the community, Tom Mooney, Luis Revuelta, others who, if you charge them and said, bring us

forward an appropriate test, we want to find out, but we really have to protect the north, and we want to do a pilot project, but if it turns out its not the best thing for the north, its tested in such a way so that the north maintains its integrity, and I certainly think that can be done, I propose certain things; I think that really is a fair and appropriate way to go. So I would respectfully request in closing that one, you as quickly as possible move a permanent ordinance for the south, and also charge staff including, if it helps working with the community, to come up with an appropriate test for the north that we'll find out if it will work on a permanent basis and do so in a manner that doesn't threaten the architectural integrity of the north. Thank you very much.

Mayor Slesnick: Thank you Robert. Luis Revuelta, 1417 Santa Cruz, and Luis I think this is your first time back, I'm not sure, but I think it's the first time back....

Mr. Revuelta: I'm getting old, so probably I don't remember the other ones.

Mayor Slesnick: No, first time back since you were highlighted in the Miami Herald as one of Miami's inspirational great architects and helping change the face of the City; speaking of the grander City so we compliment you, we did in fact, it was brought up here, I don't know that you ever saw that meeting, but you were talked about then as were the other Coral Gables architects there.

Mr. Revuelta: Thank you very much for recognizing that, I'm convinced that they have run out of architects so I lost....it couldn't come at a better time, I guess, thank you very much. Good morning and thank you for the opportunity to speak this morning, actually I want to say that I am grateful to the Lord and my parents to have brought me to this country and be able to listen to somebody speak with the freedom that the first gentleman spoke, that was a real pleasure and....it was good to hear somebody could express themselves that way. I've been a resident for twenty-eight years, as you read in the court; I reside right now at 1417 Santa Cruz with two of my four children and my wife, it's a Med-Revival home built in 1926, wouldn't dream to put a metal roof on that house, we are willing to put that in writing. Moving to 1045 Castile, which is a 1953, probably the ugliest block house in the area, you've heard me say that before, basically [inaudible], and if I can convince you guys to give us the opportunity of a pilot program, I would like the opportunity to present it to the proper Boards and the proper regulations to see if I can turn that into a Florida vernacular home with a metal roof. I am in full support of making it permanent in the south and hopefully we can achieve the same in the north. But we are presenting the argument that with the proper regulations and further refined by the Board and the DNC, a Florida vernacular style with a standing seam metal roof with architectural honesty, safety, and efficiency presents would not harm the historical context of the Med-Revival homes and colleges built in the twenty's, thirties, and early forties, mainly in the north Gables. I believe that allowing a test pilot program in the north with the same or tighter regulations than the south, in my opinion its not objective, but most of all I don't think its fair. The Board of Architects unanimously agrees, it did before, it does now even with some new members. The Planning and Zoning unanimously also agrees for the north to be included, and so secularly at the meeting. Two of the [inaudible] Boards members are architects and only two members that did not vote in the affirmative was because they wanted further information on the south prior to making their vote and making a commitment. The pros and the cons as you know have been heard and discussed and now both sides of the argument based on our personal preferences and therefore

the high level of subjectivity. In the end, and finally to take out in my opinion, the subjectivity out of the argument, the only two remaining issues which I think you are going to be faced today when you vote, is collecting empirical data to make an objective decision on the north, as you did on the south, and in fairness as [inaudible] as I said before, we all have a great respect for this Commission, the Planning staff, and the sincere views of which we all have a respectful philosophical disagreement, which hopefully will come to an end soon, one way or another. Please rest assured we would not be requesting this opportunity if we were not convinced the north will not lose its character nor the south, and there will be no negative economic impact on our homes in the neighborhoods. We have always tried to request as many opinions as possible from fellow architects and citizens and essentially almost all feel the same way. You do not see the roof that much for landscaping in the Coral Gables area, and the roof materials do not define the City. Even Mr. Murai who has been a strong opponent has been on the record as saying, if its going to be implemented it should be citywide. If, and its an "if" a big "if" the few homes that eventually will qualify for the short test in the north can prove the City's arguments correct, the impact in the neighborhood would be minimal and we would be forever proved architecturally wrong, however, if the brief program shows that there is the potential for the compatibility we foresee, the City and the residents stand to gain a diversity that will bring economic, steady gain, safety, and energy conservation to the area. Like Mr. Mooney has mentioned many times before, these homes with the proper detailing and individual styles revitalize the quality of styles – homes, and probably the most important of all, the introduction of this style by contrast will better define [inaudible]... the turn-style and architectural quality of the Med-Revival homes with their historical clay tile roofs. Anytime historical details in styles can be clearly defined the better the overall context of the City historical context and structures. Essentially I request today, a simple, please allow in all fairness a similar test program in north Gables with either requirements as proposed by Tom Mooney, Robert Fine, staff, the Planning and Zoning Board and the Board of Architects. Please observe and analyze the context of this style with the existing surroundings in a matter that is fair and most of all objective, and please make a decision. Rest assured that even in disagreement you have our professional respect. Thank you very much.

Mayor Slesnick: As we respect you, Luis. OK. As I said before what we will do is, is my not to be secretive about it, but I presume that there is at least one Commissioner here that will be bringing forth or asking that we place on a future agenda probably sooner than later the question again of extending the south or expanding to the whole City and that will be advertised as public hearing.

Commissioner Anderson: Sure. If I might speak to some of the comments made, seems like today people are getting into my head and speaking words that I've never spoken, so let me just clarify some things, and I'll attempt to be brief. I once asked Arva what would Merrick think of whatever it was I asked her for, and she goes it's not important not to get into his head, and which I agree, and indeed our City was founded on Mediterranean principals and that was one of his main themes on which many accolades came. In 1928 he was unkindly and unceremoniously kicked off the Commission, and he had a ten year plan, and that expired at some point and then in the late 1930's and 1940's other things took place. A recent question I asked was of our housing stock, what is the percentage of the houses that are Mediterranean or during the time period; eighty-seven (87%) of the homes in Coral Gables were built from 1940 and on, so there is one thing however that Merrick was very, very clear about, and Mr. Girtman was absolutely

right, he did seek architectural harmony, and harmony can include metal roofs, and it can be respectful of the context of the north. I encourage you all to drive around the areas of the north, and you'll find that there is a great majority of the homes that are not Mediterranean; the ones that are, are beautiful, and God bless them and we wouldn't want to touch those; but there are others that can be done properly with metal roofs, and I would like to bring that back at the next Commission meeting so that we can actually give resolution to this once and for all, and let these folks know where we are going.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: We need to make a decision one way or another...

Commissioner Anderson: Absolutely.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: I'm tired of coming up here and discussing this....

Commissioner Anderson: Me too.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: I've had it, I've had it, I've really have had it.

Commissioner Cabrera: Closure, closure....

Commissioner Anderson: Absolutely.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: One way or another.

Commissioner Cabrera: But this is the part that's interesting, and I don't want to take away from your commentary, did you want to....

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: No, I'm finished, I'm finished.

Commissioner Cabrera: OK, take us through the timelines; we are now still in the middle of a pilot program, the pilot program is now over...

City Manager Brown: Correct.

Commissioner Cabrera: ...I want to make sure, I really truly wasn't completely clear on whether the southern pilot program is still in place.

Mr. Riel: The pilot program was initiated for ninety (90) days from July 17th to October 17th of 2007. There is a sunset clause saying that if you didn't get your permit, it's over, there is no provisions in the Code that allows metal roofs with the exception of copper, only other exceptions being in the annexed areas.

Commissioner Cabrera: OK, stay here. So if we in fact were to move forward with a pilot program to the north Gables would it be structured in the same fashion as the south Gables, or would we....let's get an answer on my question first.

Mr. Riel: Yes, the same rules and regulations.

Commissioner Cabrera: So in essence what we would do is, we would agree to do the similar program that we decided not to do because we were so concerned about the architectural differences between the north and the south, so now we would repeat what we....

Mr. Riel: The Commission's direction is to implement a north...

Commissioner Cabrera: Yes, be we deferred; OK, then at that point there would be a ninety (90) day pilot program and you would come back to us with your results whether it's a video or handouts what-have-you, and we'll go back to the Planning Board at some point in time.

Mr. Riel: Depending on how you want to structure it.

Commissioner Cabrera: OK.

Mr. Riel: We came back with a progress report directly to the Commission.

Commissioner Cabrera: Right.

Mr. Riel: On the previous ninety (90) day.

Commissioner Cabrera: You know, I'm going to tell you, the only way that I would even contemplate the ninety (90) day trial period in the north Gables, is if at the end of the trial period or pilot program, whatever it is we want to call it, we make a decision, because there are so many more pressing issues in this City than metal roofs that I'm just sick and tired of getting e-mails from people that want to tell me and embellish upon the merits of metal roofs. So I share my two colleague's frustration, and I'm not trying to attack you about it, but I want everybody to know that I'm ready to make a decision.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Me too.

Mr. Riel: Also point of clarification, if you come back and do a ninety (90) day program you have to allow for ninety to one hundred and eighty days for those roofs to be constructed...

Commissioner Cabrera: I know it's ridiculous.

Mr. Riel:...because that's the issues when we came back in January we only presented ten (10) of the twenty-four (24), so...

Commissioner Cabrera: So what could happen though, what could happen Mr. Riel, is that when Ms. Anderson brings this item to us, if we approve it, then you've got another timeline – nine months?- eight months?

Mr. Riel: Nine months for sure, at least six months.

Commissioner Cabrera: OK six months, and then we make a decision. The only way we would come to closure Commissioners, is if in fact when she brings it to us we say no, and that's it, the issue dies, unless somebody else...

Mayor Slesnick: Remember there is a multiple set of issues here, I mean the south,

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: It frees the south.

Mayor Slesnick: We could further in the south.

Commissioner Cabrera: Do you all agree though that its time to make...

Mayor Slesnick: Yes, it's the only way to close the decision on the north could be to say no now, that would close that.

Commissioner Anderson: I totally agree, and I just want to reiterate eighty-seven percent (87%) of the houses are not Mediterranean so, as we enter into that thought process...

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Eighty-seven percent throughout the City of Coral Gables.

Commissioner Anderson: Of the housing stock.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Have you geographically broken that out...?

Commissioner Anderson: No, I haven't...

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: North of Coral Way and...

Commissioner Anderson: No, I haven't, no, I haven't.

Mayor Slesnick: You know, I think going back to Ralph's point, you know, Arva does not go back and try to analyze what Merrick said or thought, but she talks about exactly what you're talking about, but she talked about how in fact the City was Mediterranean, lost its way and came back toward Mediterranean, and certainly I consider Coral Gables a Mediterranean City, and I think that's our bread and butter. We can't distinguish Coral Gables from other Cities, there is no....you know everyone has to have a hook to be able to hang its hat on, and so I don't think that's the defining way we decide on metal roofs whether Mediterranean or not, but I just want to say if it came up.

Commissioner Anderson: I think it's on the appropriateness of the harmony...

Mayor Slesnick: But since it came up I wanted to state my position that I think we are Mediterranean City, and I think that our future and the value of our City as far as being a – having a place, a card holder is that its Mediterranean, and every time I see a feature whether it's a feature in Parade Magazine about Venetian Pool, or whether it's a feature on the Today Show by Barbara Corcoran, people talk about us as a Mediterranean City, and I was sitting in a brand

new restaurant, Por Fin, the other day, and they spent a good deal of money on that building, it's a beautiful Mediterranean building, and the owner was saying how wonderful it would be if more buildings around them would adopt that same kind of look and feel with the barrel tile roofs, and the terraces, and the balconies, and so forth, and of course that's what our Mediterranean ordinance is all about. But you're right Ralph; we either decide to go forward or not.

Commissioner Cabrera: And then to stay with you on this discussion, Don, you know, we already screwed it up, I mean we can tell everybody we live in a Mediterranean City, but I've lived here now forty-one years, I've lived in four different homes, and none of them have been Mediterranean.

Mayor Slesnick: But we've carried off that image and to just junk it and say well....

Commissioner Cabrera: I know, I know, I know, but my point to you is we've already screwed it up; when we started to build these ranch houses back in the forties or whenever, and I've lived in a ranch style home all my life, I'd love to own a Mediterranean home, but it seems every time I was ready to buy one, I couldn't afford it, for whatever reason, plus I wanted a two-car garage, and they don't make many Mediterranean homes with two-car garages, but my point is not only did we screw it up by allowing the ranch style homes, then we screwed it up by allowing the ranch style houses to be Mediterranean "wannabes", and boy you talk about looking ridiculous, and I'll go on the record, I'll go on the record if you...

Commissioner Anderson: I second that emotion.

Commission Cabrera: My family is ready to disown me because you know, my parents and my sister live in a Mediterranean "wannabe" ranch style house, I don't get it. So regardless of that...

Mayor Slesnick: There are certain ways in which you can kind of over do that or screw it up or...

Commissioner Cabrera: You can screw it up by putting a Spanish "S" tile...

Mayor Slesnick: Let me tell you, there are some ranch style houses with barrel tile that what the citizens wanted, and it doesn't look back, I mean, I'm not an architect, but I can tell you it doesn't look bad.

Commissioner Cabrera: You're right, it doesn't look bad, but – it doesn't look bad, but it's almost like that was not the original intent, when that house was built in 1946 or 1952 or 1958 it was flat tile roofs.

Mayor Slesnick: It was returning veterans and...

Commissioner Cabrera: I know, like my house 1949, it had a flat tile roof then, and today it has a flat tile roof, another house – you know we could go on and on about this, but the point that I'm trying to make is that this idea of living in a Mediterranean City is kind of nice, but the reality is we don't live in one, I just don't...

Mayor Slesnick: I think we should do everything we can to continue that image because that is – if you go back and read everything about Coral Gables our image is a Mediterranean City.

Commissioner Cabrera: Then we are governing taste, then we are governing taste.

Mayor Slesnick: Absolutely, our Zoning Code does govern taste.

Commissioner Cabrera: Look, I still have mixed issues about this metal roof issue, but I'm going to make a decision, I think Mr. Revuelta deserve it, all the people that spoke today, Mr. Airan, all the people, Mr. Fine you certainly deserve it, but the guy next to you really deserves it Mr. Riel deserves a closure on this issue.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Let's get finished.

Commissioner Anderson: Let's bring it back.

Mayor Slesnick: OK, with that we are going to go to closing comments, Maria Anderson.

Commissioner Withers: What did we just...

Commissioner Anderson: Well we are going to bring it back; I'd like to bring it back on the 29th or the first meeting in May, which ever one is – 29th of April we have three weeks, let's bring it back, let's do it.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Bring it back and get finished with it.

Commissioner Anderson: A draft ordinance.

City Manager Brown: Ninety north....what are we bringing back?

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: There is a recommendation from the Planning Board isn't it?

Mayor Slesnick: Let's do this, bring back a couple choices you know, extend the south, pilot program, add the north as a separate recommendation as a pilot program, if we vote it down we can vote not to have a pilot program, that ends it as Ralph says; if we vote to extend it in the south we can do that. Now here's the deal, the real thing is someday you may want to vote to amend the ordinance, I mean; the fact of the matter is Mr. Riel pointed out very clearly that we are doing all these pilot projects but the ordinance does not allow these except for our pilot program, which we exempted from the ordinance, so at some point in time if we ever go past pilot programs we've got to go back to the ordinance, the underlying ordinance and amend them.

City Manager Brown: Mr. Mayor...

Mayor Slesnick: It's going to be a permanent feature of our City.

Commissioner Withers: Don, we've talked last time about dealing with the, as Ralph calls it, the "wannabe" tiles on the roof...

Commissioner Cabrera: That's a Pandora's Box.

Commissioner Withers: We talked about encompassing the whole review of that.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: I thought we were already doing that.

Commissioner Cabrera: I don't think so.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Well, with regards to the...

City Manager Brown: Mr. Mindreau, the Board of Architects is taking a closer look at putting tiles on...

Commissioner Cabrera: A closer look?

All

Commissioner Cabrera: What's a closer look define that for me. Come back Mr. Riel.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Where's Carlos today, where's Carlos today, where's our Board of Architect? He's on vacation. Mrs. Lubin, I think you understand what is going on there; as I understand from the Board of Architects prior to this past year, if you wanted to put a barrel type roof or any type of roof on a 1950's structure you just had to meet the determination of our Building Code whatever building material met, it was approved then by Manny, subsequent to that over the last few months we have changed that, we are now every single tile roof comes in front of the Board of Architects, is that correct?

City Manager Brown: The low profile.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: The low profile, so....

Ms. Lubin: Up until a few years ago, I would say, roof materials did not go to the Board of Architects at all, it went to the building official period, and if it was allowable to install that type of roof on that, and that type of roof was allowed by Code, Manny would approve it.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: So in other words just to emphasize, the small, what they call the roll tiles, low profile tiles....

Ms. Lubin: The 1940's homes were "Mediterraneanized" by putting a barrel tile roof was done solely by the approval of the building official and not by the Board of Architects.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Alright, so now I have a 1950 style house, I want to put a new roof on, what's going to happen as far as my roof goes?

Ms. Lubin: Presently you need to go to the Board of Architects.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Alright, so I come in and I put that low profile, they can say no to that and....

Ms. Lubin: Actually low profile “S” tile...

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Would not work again.

Ms. Lubin:...would not work, they've...

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: So that's all over, so it's all over, we don't have to talk about that again.

Ms. Lubin: It was done in the past, it's not allowed now.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: So I have to go back to my cement tiles, right?

Ms. Lubin: They would look at that.

Commissioner Withers: But is that an ordinance?

Ms. Lubin: The type of material is done in the Zoning Code, but there is a list of roofing materials that are allowed, barrel tile is allowed, “S” tile is allowed, I think it's a policy for the low profile not to be allowed, that's a written policy.

Commissioner Withers: All I'm saying, the Mayor brought up a point about rewriting an ordinance to encompass the feeling of the Commission as far as materials; we have a policy on “S” tiles but it's not an ordinance on “S” tiles, I don't know how those two conflict with each other....?

Ms. Lubin: There is a list in the Code, in the Zoning Code that allows certain materials for roofing materials.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: The determination is now with the Board of Architects basically right, is that correct?

Commissioner Withers: Is that where we want it to be?

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Well, I mean, you are going to have the Board of Architects involved in these other roofing materials, where else would it be? Do you want to just eliminate the small profile tiles?

Commissioner Withers: Listen, I mean, looking at that slide show, what jumped out at me was that glass atrium-looking edifice.

Commissioner Anderson: And they did come back to about six or seven times.

Commissioner Withers: Its not really put into a Mediterranean neighborhood, I mean, you know, I think a metal roofs is close to that more than that glass façade does.

Commissioner Cabrera: We've just got to move on, man.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: This is crazy.

Commissioner Cabrera: We've got to move on.

Commissioner Anderson: Let's move on.

Mayor Slesnick: Thank you all.

[End: 12:17:10 p.m.]