



The City of Coral Gables

Historical Resources Department

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES Thursday, October 18, 2012, 4:00 p.m. City Commission Chambers 405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:	N	D	J	F	M	A	M	J	J	A	S	O	APPOINTED BY:
Dorothy Thomson	P	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Mayor Jim Cason
Margaret Rolando	P	-	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Alejandro Silva	P	-	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Maria Anderson
Venny Torre	P	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr.
Kendell Turner	P	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Frank C. Quesada
Carmen Guerrero*		-				P	P	E	P	P	E	P	Historic Preservation Board
Deborah Tackett	P	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	City Manager
Dolly MacIntyre	E	-	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	City Commission
Judy Pruitt	P	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	City Commission

A = Absent
P = Present
E = Excused
*** = New Member**
^ = Resigned Member
- = No Meeting

STAFF:

Dona Spain, Historic Preservation Officer
Kara N. Kautz Assistant Preservation Officer
Cindy Dorrel, Administrative Assistant
Craig Leen, City Attorney
Eric Riel, City Planner
Christina Flatau, Deputy City Attorney's Office

PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

GUESTS: Sallye Jude, Jim Jude, John Rogers, Tine Hestbaek, Melanie Britt, Candy Albano, Rebecca Albano, Christopher Soulakis, Burton Hersh, Sydney Towne, Dana Riccoboro, Matthew Johnson, Donald Sackman, Maximiliano Siwa

The meeting was called to order by Ms. Tackett at 4:04 p.m. A quorum was present.

MEETING ATTENDANCE:

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to excuse the absence of Ms. Rolando. Ms. Pruitt seconded the motion, unanimously passed by voice vote.

MINUTES: MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 20, 2012:

Mr. Silva made a motion to approve the minutes of the meeting of September 20, 2012 as presented. Ms. Turner seconded the motion, unanimously passed by voice vote.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Ms. Tackett read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. She stated that if any members of the board had ex parte communication or contact regarding any cases being heard, it was necessary to disclose such communication or contact.

DEFERRALS: 1433 Mendavia Avenue (historical significance determination).

PUBLIC SWEARING IN:

Ms. Morgan administered the public swearing in for those who would testify during the meeting.

PERSONAL APPEARANCE:

City Planner Riel reviewed an October 10, 2012 report (provided to Board members in advance of the meeting) which contained final drafts of Zoning Code text amendments requested by the Historical Resources Department. After describing the history of Zoning Code rewrites and updates and stating that 60 amendments to the Code had been made since 2007. Of 20 additional amendments under consideration at present, three were related to historic preservation issues and required review and approval by the Board:

- Section 3-1107. Demolition of buildings and/or structures
- Section 3-1113. Variances
- Section 3-1115. Undue Economic Hardship.

Ms. Spain thoroughly reviewed each of the three proposed amendments, stating that the proposed amendments were reviewed by various City departments, including the City Attorney, and, if approved by this Board, would pass to the Planning Board and, ultimately, to the City Commission for adoption. She highlighted specific areas of proposed change and explained the meaning and purpose of each. After additional input by the City Attorney and a period of Board discussion, a motion regarding the amendments was made.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to recommend approval of all three amendments with a text correction on Section 3-1107 to read “. . . shall be held within sixty (60) days” . . . rather than, “a minimum of sixty (60) days”; and in Section 3-1113, to leave in the words, “historic landmark” on line two after the word, “local.” Mr. Silva seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Turner, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Guerrero, Mr. Torre, Mr. Silva, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Tackett. Nays: None.

LOCAL HISTORIC DESIGNATION:

CASE FILE LHD 2012-02: Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at **1425 Sorolla Avenue**, legally described as Lot 17, Block 19, Coral Gables Section “E,” according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 13, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

This request for consideration of local historic designation was initiated by the homeowner. Ms. Kautz displayed and reviewed a location map, the property’s history and ownership, plans, architecture, photographs and renovations, concluding that staff recommended approval based on architectural significance.

Commissioner Cabrera was welcomed to the meeting.

Ms. Tackett invited the homeowner and other audience members to speak. Receiving no requests for comment, she closed the public hearing and opened Board discussion.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to approve the local historic designation of the property at 1425 Sorolla Avenue. Ms. Turner seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Thomson, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Guerrero, Mr. Torre, Ms. Turner, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Silva, Ms. Tackett. Nays: None.

CASE FILE LHD 2012-03 and COA (SP) 2012-017: Consideration of the local historic designation of and an accelerated Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **1021 Asturia Avenue**, legally described as Lot 17, Block 7, Coral Gables Section "C," according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 26, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for the restoration of the residence.

The property's location, history, photographs, architecture, features and finishes, addition and alterations were displayed and reviewed by Ms. Kautz, who added that original plans could not be found and the architect was unknown. She concluded by stating that staff recommended approval based on architectural significance.

Ms. Tackett invited audience members to speak to the application. As there were no requests to speak, Ms. Tackett closed the public hearing and called for Board comment.

Ms. Thomson made a motion to approve local historic designation for the property located at 1021 Asturia Avenue. Mr. Torre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Guerrero, Mr. Torre, Mr. Silva, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Turner, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Tackett. Nays: None.

Regarding the application for issuance of an accelerated Certificate of Appropriateness, Ms. Kautz reviewed plans for the restoration and alterations, adding that variances were not requested. She concluded by stating that staff recommended approval of issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness.

No one in the audience requested to speak to the application, so Ms. Tackett closed the public hearing.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to approve the issuance of an accelerated Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 1021 Asturia Avenue. Ms. Pruitt seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Guerrero, Mr. Torre, Mr. Silva, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Turner, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Tackett. Nays: None.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2012-016: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **180 Aragon Avenue**, "The Colonnade," a local historic landmark. A lengthy legal description is on file in the Historical Resources Department. The applicant requested design approval for interior and exterior alterations to the portion of the building that is not part of the original structure.

Ms. Spain reviewed the history of the building and the proposed alteration project to the location of a former restaurant to accommodate a new one, Sushi Samba. She relayed that the Building Department reviewed and approved the plans, and a Zoning review did not reveal the need for variances.

Architect Hersh reviewed the proposed design, alterations and materials. During discussion, Board members had numerous questions regarding proposed materials, and expressed a desire to see samples. Mr. Hersh agreed to return with samples for Board review and approval if requested. Specific Board concerns included the acrylic panel weave proposed for the exterior, the rough porcelain and black porcelain tiles, floor finishes, a color rendering, a sample of the concrete stain color proposed for the bar (with a natural white stain suggested), and a finish board. Mr. Hersh reiterated his willingness to return with sample materials at the next Board meeting.

At the conclusion of Mr. Hersh's presentation, Ms. Tackett invited audience comment. Hearing no requests for audience participation, she closed the public hearing and asked for Board comment.

Mr. Silva made a motion to approve the application. Ms. Pruitt seconded the motion, thereafter amended, with approval by Mr. Silva, to require the applicant to return to the Board for review of all proposed materials and colors, a color rendering of the project and a finish board.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Torre, Mr. Silva, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Turner, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Guerrero, Ms. Tackett. Nays: None.

BOARD ITEMS / CITY COMMISSION / CITY PROJECTS UPDATE:

408 Viscaya Avenue/French Normandy Village Door Issue: As a continuation of the door replacement discussion held at the September 2012 meeting, appearing to speak with the Board about the issue were homeowner Rebecca Albano and her mother/designer, Candy Albano. Ms. Candy Albano requested approval for a same single panel French door and finish (to match the home's other windows and doors) for the relocated and replaced door. For context, Ms. Kautz described the original Village doors as she displayed photographs. During discussion with Board members, staff, Candy and Rebecca Albano, Ms. Jude and Mr. Rogers, Ms. Tackett noted the broader Village features issue and recommended development and adoption of a master plan to provide some consistency for external features. She cautioned that the Board's decision about this application may eventually be part of an overall master plan for the historically-designated district, particularly in the absence of a governing homeowners' association. It was pointed out that most Village doors are not impact-resistant, so similar applications may occur in the future. Ms. Jude advocated for flexibility for individual expression in external appearances for the Village which isn't uniform in nature, and encouraged owner freedom to determine options with Board review for appropriateness. Contractor Rogers described the CGI metal door (half glass/half door) and stain that Ms. Jude wants for her unit.

Mr. Torre stated that individuality could be permitted with Board review as long as the door selection is consistent with the overall style and design characteristics, with homogeneous colors. Ms. Candy Albano specified a door option that fit their budget, preferably a simple, bronze metal French door with mullions as they proposed. Discussion continued, with preferences stated with certain consistencies in appearance and an allowance for some individual preference features. Ms. MacIntyre expressed preference for a range of external paint colors as part of an allowed feature.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to approve a French door in a finish that blends with the newly-installed windows, with the alternative possibility of selecting a wood-like/half-light door, if available, all to be reviewed and approved by staff. Ms. Pruitt seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Silva, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Turner, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Guerrero, Ms. Tackett. Nays: Mr. Torre.

Windows Workshop: Ms. MacIntyre reported that she submitted a \$1,000 grant application to the Villagers, which passed the group's project committee and board of directors, pending only an anticipated vote of approval by membership. The grant application stipulated that the Board would be a co-partner in the workshop and would match the grant.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion for the Historic Preservation Board to co-sponsor (with the Villagers) a windows workshop, using \$1,000 from the Board's trust fund. Ms. Guerrero seconded the motion.

Ms. Turner requested a workshop budget for the workshop, but Ms. MacIntyre explained that exact expenses were unknown, pending knowledge of speaker stipends and printing expenses. She anticipated generating venue and refreshments donations. Ms. Tackett commended Ms. MacIntyre for her diligent efforts and encouraged Board support of pledging up to \$1,000 in co-sponsorship to allow the project to move forward, with the Board receiving actual expense information as it became known. Staff confirmed that the trust fund balance is approximately \$40,000.

Ms. MacIntyre accepted an amendment to the motion to pledge to provide up to \$1,000 subject to documentation of actual budget expenses for the workshop. Ms. Pruitt also accepted the amendment.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Thomson, Ms. Turner, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Guerrero, Mr. Torre, Mr. Silva, Ms. Tackett. Nays: None.

1044 Coral Way: Ms. Spain reported that the issue on the removal of the designation that the Board did not approve is being appealed to the City Commission, and will be heard October 30, 2012.

George Merrick Painting: Ms. Spain reported that the contract with Rustin Levenson Art Conservation Associates was signed and is undergoing required City processes. It is anticipated that the restoration work will begin soon.

University of Miami Architectural Students: Ms. Guerrero asked for Board consideration of a proposal by several graduate architectural students (with minors in historic preservation), to collaborate with the Board and Historical Resources Department. They want to serve the City in exchange for independent study credits that would be managed by the University. The students will be available beginning January 14, 2013 and for the entire Spring semester. Ms. Spain will develop a list of projects that could be mutually beneficial.

Historic Preservationist: Ms. Spain received resumes from candidates for the position, and indicated the possibility of introducing the new staff person at the next meeting.

LeJeune Road and Alhambra Circle Entrance: Ms. Spain will speak with the City Attorney to determine his ruling regarding possible sunshine issues related to fact and information-finding meetings among Board members (Ms. Turner, Mr. Silva, Mr. Torre) involved in the project to rebuild the coral rock monument formerly situated in the Alhambra Circle median at the intersection of Alhambra Circle and LeJeune Road. The project will ultimately come before the Board for approval.

Town Plan: Ms. Spain reported that Jorge Hernandez would attend a future board meeting to continue discussion about a town plan.

AIA Annual General Membership Meeting: Mr. Silva encouraged Board attendance at the meeting scheduled October 24th beginning at 5:30 at Miami Senior High School, which was just historically renovated. A tour of the facility will be conducted at 5:30. There will also be a presentation on the renovation and design of the historic Post Office.

Proposed Art Monuments: Mr. Silva requested information about two public art monuments proposed for the City, one of which will come before the Board.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 5:55 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Dona M. Spain
Historic Preservation Officer